PAPER PROCEEDING OF RELIGIOUS STUDIES 2013

ISSN 2279-3704
ICRS 2013

Conference Chair

Prof. Dr. Toshiichi Endo
Professor of the Center of Buddhist Studies,
University of Hong Kong

Conference Convener

Prabhath Patabendi
International Center for Research & Development (ICRD)

ORGANIZER

International Center for Research & Development (ICRD)

THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Prof. Dr. Toshiichi Endo, HK
Dr Tahseen Jafry (UK)
Prof. Dr. N. S. Cooray
Prof. Risa Morimoto (France)
Dr. Fiona Roberg (Sweden)
Prof. Risa Morimoto (France)
Prof. Jai Pal Singhe (India)
Prof. Patricia Ordóñez de Pablos (Spain)
Dr. Md. Jahirul Alam Azad (Bangladesh)
Prof. (SMT.) T. Jaya Manohar (India)
Dr. Premachandra Wattege (UK)
Dr. Janina Scheelhaase (Germany)
Prof. R. L. Stirrat (Netherland)
Dr. Anuradha Benerjee (India)
Prof. Parul Rishi (India)
Suggested Citation

DISCLAIMER:

All views expressed in these proceedings are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of, and should not be attributed to, the International Center for Research & Development, Sri Lanka.

The publishers do not warrant that the information in this report is free from errors or omissions.

The publishers do not accept any form of liability, be it contractual, tortuous, or otherwise, for the contents of this report for any consequences arising from its use or any reliance placed on it.

The information, opinions and advice contained in this report may not relate to, be relevant to, a reader’s particular interest.

Portions of this work are copyrighted. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act, the copyrighted parts may not be reproduced by any process, electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owners. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

International Center for Research and Development
No: 858/6,
Kaduwela Road,
Thalangama North,
Malabe,
Sri Lanka
Tel: +94112744306
Fax: +94112744306

Email: info@theicrd.org
Web: www.theicrd.com
The Interactions of Place and Space in Myths: Mapping the Supine Demoness of Tibet

Wu, Pin-Ta

Abstract

Do human beings bear a sense of gender consciousness toward an imagined geography? In answering to this interesting question from the context of Tibetan myth of genesis, we could realize that the medieval Tibetan geography was not only deemed as a huge naked ogress Srin-mo pinned down by twelve Buddhist temples but also mapped across the interactions of place and space in terms of Tibetan mythical narratives, its imagined landscapes, and historical records.

Srin-mo, a supine body as an “willed inserted” production, is legitimated by Buddhism against Bon religion through the Tibetan King Srongbtsanggampo and is reinforced by a meditative vision from Tang Dynasty’s princess named rgyakongjo both implicitly trigger gender and political issues and hybrid cultural religious articulations beyond the map of Srin-mo.

This paper has three parts: first, I snapshot both Orient and West’s imagination of gendering Tibetans and geographies. Second, the reciprocality between demoness and nature will be explained further to understand how the image of Srin-mo correlate with Bon religion and link to Tibetans’ view of visualizing Tibet. Third, I argue that Srin-mo can be seen as a benevolent female instead of an evil demoness in gender stereotyping.

Keywords: Tibetan Buddhism, geography, Srin-mo, place, space, myths
The Interactions of Place & Space in Myths:  
Mapping the Supine Demoness of Tibet

Wu, Pin-Ta

1. Introduction: Tibet as a Gendered Geography of Imagination

Do human beings bear a sense of gender consciousness toward an imagined geography? Positioning this question in the context of Tibet, we could understand that the agency of gender not only influences the way of seeing but also inspires varies of evaluations in experiences especially in western cultural imagination. In Martin Brauen’s *Dreamworld Tibet: Western Illusions* (2004), the research on Western literary imagination as fantasy-projecting, he sums up seven characteristics of Tibet image including the secret wisdom, peacefulness, fountain of youth, a power place, a retreat area, asexual place, and loathsome or macabre\(^1\) (99-111). Among the seven characteristics of fantasies, the description of Tibet as “the fountain of youth” and the “asexual place” in relation to the concept of gender are the most explicit imageries. As to the fountain of youth, the notion could be found in James Hilton’s *Lost Horizon* (1933). The novel describes Tibet as Shangri-la as well as a representation of Utopia where makes people in youth without aging due to the fountain. The gush of the youthful fountain from the land of Tibet symbolizes that Tibet is personified as a non-gender child with great and inexhaustible vitality.

Tibet, on the other hand, is also interpreted as an asexual place. In Brauen’s research, Tibet is not only a worldly paradise “as secret garden of desire” but also a sacred geography where appeals neither to heterosexuality nor homosexuality. On the contrary, the reason that Tibet uniquely reveals a state of asexual atmosphere is because in these most remote mountains are inhabited with “sacred men – monks, lamas and tulkus.” (219) In this way, it seems very difficult to precisely define the gender of Tibet which can be further proved in Shrii P. R. Sarkar’s *Microvitum in a Nutshell* (1921-1990). One of the parts named

---

\(^1\) Martin Brauen supports these characteristics in *Dreamworld Tibet* with the novels of Lionel Davidson’s *The Rose of Tibet*, Junius Podrug’s *Frost of Heaven*, C. C. Bergius’s *Endstation Tibet*, and Angus MacVicar’s *The Atom Chasers in Tibet* (1957) (99-111).
“Disembodied Souls and Microvita – Section B” in this book analyzes the ancient Sanskrit name of Tibet:

The ancient name of Tibet was “Kimpurusavarsa”. One meaning of “varsa” is “land” or “country”. [...] The inhabitants of Tibet have very little hair on their bodies, so it is often difficult to distinguish between males and females, just as it is difficult to distinguish between males and females in Bhutan. Hence, in ancient Tibet, people would wonder if a person was a male. In Samskrta the land was called “Kimpurusavarsa”.²

From Sarkar’s explanation, we could recognize that naming Tibet is based on gender ideology and Tibet is enacted as a male's body as well as a signifier in the discourse of Tibet’s subjectivity. Kimpurusavarsa means a geographical realm where the sexual orientation cannot be identified. It also echoes the conception of youth that the sense of uncertain gender is shared in Martin Brauen’s ideas that Tibet as an asexual region. Sarkar further explains the root of the word Kimpurusavarsa in its morphological features: “Varśa means ‘that which is being showered.’ It is a masculine term. In its feminine form it is Varśá (the feminine suffix “á” is added). The second meaning is ‘a large island.’”³ According to Sarkar’s interpretation, Tibet resembles the feminine description as a large island which interestingly links to Tibetannarratives of creation myth that Tibet itself is the body of a demoness or a raksasicalled Srin-mo, a naked supine body pinned by twelve Tibetan monasteries lying on every realm of Tibet.

As we could see nowadays, the image of Srin-mo falls into a pattern and becomes an unmovable space or even a stereotyped vision overlapping with the map of Tibet. This paper aims to explore the Supine demoness of Tibet from the perspective of place and space in order to understand how the image of Srin-mo correlate with Bon religion and link to Tibetans’ visualization to Tibet. And I attempt to argue as a defender that Srin-mo can be seen

²Disembodied Souls and Microvita – Section B (http://www.heartwillteyi.org/am/Ananda%20M.%20books/HTML/Discourses/Disembodied_Souls_and_Microvita_Section_B.html) 2013.06.10
as a benevolent female from the mythical narratives instead of an evil demoness trapped in gender stereotyping.

2. Method: Gender Theories in Geographies

The paper holds the theoretical concept “gendering geographies” in order to apply in the religious context Tibetan myth of Srin-mo. In Linda McDowell’s *Gender, Identity and Place: Understanding Feminist Geographies* (1999) states a clear purpose of the relations and the target in the field of gender discourse and geographies. McDowell mentions the academic research on western feminism has reached to the geographical range and engendered a so-called cultural turn form resisting the patriarchal subject or the institution to a new approach of exploring the female body and the experiences in the context of geographies in order to re-access to female subjectivity in a symbolic way of representation and to challenge the patriarchal place, space and its discourse. (9-16)

Besides, from the feminist research in geographies of Doreen Massey’s *Space, Place and Gender* (1994), we could recognize that the construction of gender is shaped by the discourse of place and space in a dynamic articulation. This development will progress in understanding geographies not only “as an academic/intellectual discourse and set of social institutions” but also as the “found concepts and systems of knowledge.” In briefly, “gender is of significance to geographical constructions of space and place.” (Massey 180) Massey becomes conscious that the gendered space and place would not self-subjected by themselves, therefore, this situation will pushes those silenced ones to set up a new way of changing the realm of patriarchy. In Massey’s idea, the geographies with gender ideology are not only important in the construction of “symbolic” meaning of spaces/places” but also “reflect and affect the ways in which gender is constructed and understood.” (Massey 179) Echoing the ideas of Massey’s thinking, Lynda Johnston and Robyn Longhurst in *Space, Place and Sex: Geographies of Sexuality* (2010) views space as the representation of body which “is complex, changeable, discursively produced, and imbued with power relations” and
deems places as “the materiality of spaces” which correspond to Tuan Yi-Fu’s viewpoint that “places are bounded settings and the bodies that occupy them are flesh and blood and experience a range of emotions in relation to these places.” (16)

From the above, we could narrow down three main points to support my paper in exploring the image of Srin-mo related to Tibetan geographies in the place/space context. First, the aim of the feminist geographers holds the challenging and doubtful attitudes toward the so-called “natural characteristics of the geographies” in order to disclose the distinctions of gendering place/space and the power relations of patriarchy. Second, the multiple constructions of places/spaces engender the degree of mobility for us to experience each gendering culture and reflect the way we live in this world (geographies) through gender ideologies. Third, we could further understand, human beings play an important role in shaping the relations between places/spaces and in revealing the characteristics of materiality of spaces through the confirmation to the bodies, places. Therefore, based on the three viewpoints, I dig into the map of the demoness of Tibet for the sake of re-exploring the cultural implications and gender ideologies in the map (the female body of Srin-mo as space and the Tibetan temples as places).

3. The Overlapping between space and place: Landscaping Srin-mo of Tibet

Purely visioning the map of Srin-mo of Tibet, we could acknowledge that both the spatial body of demoness and Tibetan geographies are mutual overlapping in the landscapes. It seems that it reveals a sense of unbalanced and bizarre image for the first sight. The conjunction between Srin-mo and Tibet is the establishment of the twelve Tibetan monasteries spinning on the demoness’s joints for the purpose of spreading the beliefs of Buddhism and materializing Srin-mo’s body as the embodiment of the Bon religion under the control (toward a revolution) of Buddhism in the region of Tubo.

From the perspective of the place controlling, in The Spread of Buddhism (2007), KaréninaKollmar-Paulenz’s article The Buddhist way into Tibet conveys that Buddhism uses
the device of establishing the temples to oppress and fix the space of Srin-mo which not only stands for a symbolic practice in bringing the Buddhism in Tibet but also as a strategy to strengthen the ruling politics of Buddhism, to re-create the new order of religious beliefs, to stabilize the places and wide ranges of inhabitants, and to ensure each site for praying the Buddhist deities in order to reveal the boundaries of realms. In *Mani bKa'-bum* written by Tibetan King Srong-btsanggam-po (d. AD 649) mentions that the heart of Srin-mo is located in a lake called the Plain of Milk “where the first Buddhist king built his temple represented the heart of a she-demon lying on her back. The she-demon is Tibet itself, which had to be tamed before it could be inhabited and civilized.” (Stein 38-9)

Generally speaking, Srinmo’s image appears in about eighth and ninth centuries in the period of military greatness. However, the precise timing is originated in Tubo’s King Srong-btsanggam-po who got married with Tang Dynasty’s princess Kong jo and Nepalese princess Khribtsun during the establishment of Jokhang and Ramoche Monasteries (631-641 C.E.). Srin-mo is eventually attributed to the obstruction in building and developing the Tibetan temples. In Robert J. Miller’s article *The Supine Demoness*” (*Srin Mo* and the Consolidation of Empire), he cites two versions about the image of Srin-mo from Michael Aris’s MKB (*Mani bka’ bum*) and Obermiller E.’s *Bu Ston*. Through these two versions, we discover that how the she-demon’s body of Srin-mo was visionized and articulated in Srong-btsanggam-po’s words in gendering geographical perspectives of place/space:

*Bu Ston*: (The King) *saw* that the ground of Tibet was like (the body of) a she-devil that had fallen on her back, and that it was necessary to press (this she-devil) down.

*Aris/MKB*: Srongbtsanggamparamperceives that the demoness which encompasses the whole of Tibet is striking out with her arms and legs. (Miller 337)

From the two versions above, we could understand that the appearance of Srin-mo’s spatial image is shaped by both the way of seeing in places and the sense of perception to the space pointing out the real existence of the she-demon. In other words, the interrelation between space/place somehow reflects the Tibetans’ concepts gnas (in Tibetan pronounced né) toward the visualization of deities. The concept of gnas translates as “place” (Aldenderfer 10) and
also means the “abode” especially for the “Buddhist deities’ mandalic abodes” as well as a “sense of efficacious space” shaped by both the relationships between humans and deities. (Makley 154) Due to the nay conception, Srinmo could be defined as a landscaping combination in both the extension of place and the display of space with the abode of spirit forces and all kinds of deities. Precisely speaking, pre-Buddhist conception of gnas not only adheres to the belief of animism but also means the state of a co-existence by Buddhism and Bon religion.

Interestingly, the timing of Srinmo’s appearance in historical document was pointed out after the marriage with Tang Dynasty’s princess Kong jo in 641 C.E. instead of the marriage with Nepalese princess Khribtsun in 631 C. E. On the other hand, the image of Srinmo implies the two princes’ jealousy and controversy through the competition in building the monasteries. To a certain extent, their conflicts unwittingly lead themselves into a faithful piety in Buddhism and give an impetus to the propagation of Buddhism which can be proved from fifth Dalai Lama’s “The Documents of Tibetan Kings and Courtiers” (Tib: Dzogsldangzhonnu'idga' stondpyidmo'igludbyangs). Through the overlapping place/space of Tibet and Srin-mo, we understand the this landscape of demoness is shaped by Srong-btsansgam-po’s both the way of perception and visualization in reaching a state of co-existence or an interdependence between Buddhism and Bon religion. The twelve Tibetan Buddhist monasteries pinned on the body of she-demon undoubtedly becomes a symbolic implication of stabilizing the boundaries, settlement, political and military domination; positioning Lhasa as the core of the politics and economics, meanwhile through the competition in building the temples between the two princesses as an way of self-empowerment to Srong-btsansgam-po who uses the fixed and unmovable image of Srinmo to bring out his Buddhist beliefs and national sovereignty.

4. Bon religion: The origin of Srin-mo’s myth

It’s well known that the myth of Tibetans’ origin was born from the union of a monkey as
well as a Buddhist practitioner and the Srinmo as a rock-ogress. One version said that the monkey master is conferredlay-person’s vows by Bodhisattva and conducted a retreat in Tibetan caves. (Gyaltsen 75) The other mentions that the monkey is the incarnation of Bodhisattva for the purpose of practicing the mind of boddhicitta. (NorbuWanden 24) In the historical documents written in the book called Yar-lung Dynasty describes that the monkey(Tib: sPre’u) and the rock-demoness (Tib: Brag-srinmo) are the incarnation of Avalokitesvara and White Tara. (V olkmann 195-198).

According to the description about their rendezvous, they meet to each other in Yarlung valley where is located in the region of Amdo called the ancient heart of Tibet. Therefore, Tibetans are the offspring of the union of the monkey and she-demon which means human beings’ wild temper derived from the demoness is needed to be tamed. Through the gendering distinction between the nature of monkey master and Srin-mo, the Tibetans inherited his monkey father’s the merit of “compassion, piety, courage, kindness, generosity, and diligence; meanwhile, bears the corrupt sense of greed, lust, flippancy, wrath and jealousy. Thus, each one is incomplete.” (NorbuWanden 24) Also, in Rosemarie Volkmann’s “Female Stereotypes in Tibet Religion and Art”, he cites Yar-lung Dynasty’s description that “on the father's side they were quick of thought, compassionate, and considerate. One the mother's they were red-faced, indulging in sinful deeds, and crude. (194) From the above, Srinmo as an oppressed female body is stereotyped by religious patriarchy which put all the evil personalities into Srinmo’s naked body of space undoubtedly unveils the act of violence with its legitimacy to limit the mobility of Srin mo. We could realize that the Tibetan temples are not only the representation of the religious powers (the form of patriarchy) in stereotyping and fixing (or evening prisoning) Srinmo as an irreversible evil characters into the gendering geographies but also an active, symbolic way of a Buddhist activation in ritualizing a mandalic space for what we have seen nowadays in the Tibetan map of Sin mo.

Pinpointing to the myth of Srinmo and the monkey master, I discover that Srinmo’s dialogue with the monkey cannot be seen as an evil and bloody demoness instead of a logical, self-conscious, witty and emotional female. One day, Srinmo comes to the monkey master
aside with a deep sigh. She groans:

Alas! Great Monkey King!

Think of me a little an hear my plea.

By the power of my karma, I was born among the race of ogres.

As my lust grows, I have become enamoured of you.

Driven by my desire, I have come to make this request.

If you will not marry me

I will take rock-ogre husband.

Every day we will slay ten thousand living beings,

And every night we will devour a thousand creatures.

I will bear countless ogre-children

And this snowy realm will be filled with ogre-cities.

Every living creature will become an ogre's prey.

By comparison, is it not better to think of me

And show your compassion? (Gyaltsen 76)

From Srin-mo’s sincere confession with the sense of self-consciousness to her black karma, we understand her plea for the marriage is not purely to fulfill the selfish desires but importantly to express wisdom in ceasing the tragedy in the act of killing and eating ten thousands Tibetans in the future. Under her euphemistic words, we still cannot realize that it is a cunning scheme or a truly and wholeheartedly words. However, this touching words make the monkey master painful in choosing the alternative of obeying so-called spatial vows and focusing on meditation or accepting recommendations to solve Srinmo’s miseries and ensure the places in security. The monkey master’ monologic praying towards Avalokitesvara expresses the sense of ambivalence or dilemma with a profound grief:

Alas! Compassionate Protector of Beings:

I have protected my vows as I would my life.

An ogress from the race of devils, smitten by lust,

Poured forth her varied laments,
And while encircling me, came to rob me of my vows.
What can I do to protect them?
Oh! Compassionate Protector of Loving-Kindness, consider my plea.

(Gyaltsen 76)

Suddenly Avalokitesvara appears before the monkey master with a blessing to their marriage that in the future “the teachings of the Buddha might spread, flourish and endure; that spiritual friends might arise in unbroken succession; and that precious treasures might be discovered, so that benefits, happiness, virtue and goodness might increase in all ten directions.” (Gyaltsen 77) Interestingly, Avalokitesvara plays an important role in re-positioning the unbalanced space of monkey master’s Buddhist vows and the place of disasters into a peaceful balanced state.

After the marriage, they have six monkey-children as the symbol of Buddhist six realms (hell realm, hungry ghosts, animal realm, human realm, realm of the demigods, realm of the gods). Srinmo brings her children to a place called the forest of Assembled Birds where abounds in a large number of fruits; the monkey master continues to his Buddhist retreat in the remote mountains. After three years, the monkey master goes back to the forest and sees more than five hundred monkey-children crying for hungry and nothing to eat. At that time, the sense of displacement from a sacred and harmonious life of retreats to a suffering in food shortage and sterile land invokes his memory of Avalokitesvara’s blessing. He prays in piety:

Alas! Not realising that married life was a prison,
Not knowing that I had been deceived by a she-devil,
I am mired in the Samsaric mud of offspring.
Not recognising that sensual desires are poisonous leaves,
My compassion turned to lust, and I was deceived.
Bound by carnal urges, I am oppressed by a mountain of suffering.
Having swallowed the poison of defilements,
I am afflicted by the epidemic of adverse karma.
Accumulated woes torment me:
Alack! Alas! Compassionate Protector of Loving-Kindness,
How can I succour my children?
I am in this predicament at the Sublime One's behest.
We now resemble a city of hungry ghosts;
In the next life we will no doubt be reborn in the hell realms!
I therefore beseech you to protect us with your compassion.(Gyaltsen 77-8)
The end of the myth is the re-appearance of Avalokitesvara who again re-harmonizes the sterile places from the power of the sacred space and takes out the seds of wheat, peas, buckwheat and rice from the Mountain Sumeru and makes them flourishing throughout the lands. Then the monkey-children feed on grain, start to learn and communicate by languages without the long tails, and change into the form of human beings.

Through the narratives of the creation myth of Tibet, we could understand that Srinmo is perfectly competent for playing three nice roles of being a virtuous wife, mother, and a faithful Buddhist practitioner. Srinmo is a traditional wife and mother because of her selfless devotion to take care of all the monkey-children without interrupting the monkey master’s three-year Buddhist retreat. Also, Srinmo could be seen as a compassionate practitioner due to her self-restraint acts in keeping the sila without killing creatures or feeding the meat to those starveling monkey-children. We could realize that Srinmo cannot be viewed merely as an evil demoness, but a diligent female with motherhood imbued with wisdom for practicing Buddhism.

5. Conclusion

Back to the initial question that do human beings bear a sense of gender consciousness toward an imagined geography? Through the western cultural imagination and Shrii P. R. Sarkar’s research on Tibet’s Sanskrit meaning with gender ideologies toward the geographies of Tibet, we understand that the relations of space and place are the dynamic forces inter-depending, overlapping or co-existing in the progress of forming imagined or authentic
gendering geographies. In the context of Srinmo’s spatial image overlapped with the entire landscapes of Tibet, we realize that the image of Srinmo as the Tibetan autochthonous notion of space mixed with the vision of “gnas”, fixed by the twelve temples forms a symbolic state of co-existence and interdependence between Bon religion and Buddhism; meanwhile projects a spatial visualization that Tibet is mandalised into a Buddhist domination. Metaphorically speaking, the wilderness of Srinmo’s has been transformed into a Buddhist new landscape of hierophany through the establishment of the Tibetan temples which reflects Sröng-btsang-gam-po’s determination in spreading the doctrines of Buddhism and successfully create this so-called the map the supine demoness of Tibet.

Into the myth of Srinmo, we truly recognize that Srinmo cannot be treated as a stereotyped and demonized flat character in the map, but as a round character who transforms herself into a perfect image of a diligent wife, a compassionate mother and a faithful Buddhist practitioner or a dharmapala whose conflicts in the myth with the unbalanced spaces and places create a new way of thinking in undermining our established conception toward the fixed identity of demoness, simultaneously, lead Srinmo as an new model for all Buddhist believers who sacredly practices in the Buddhist spatial realm of mandala from the path of demoness, to human (a diligent female) and eventually to the perfection of Buddhahood.
References


Carbon Based Brains, Consciousness and the Christian Concept of Afterlife: ‘Multiple Realizability’ and Life Beyond This Planet

Tennyson Samraj, Ph.D.
Professor of Philosophy
5415 College Avenue
Lacombe, Alberta

The intent of this paper is to define the Christian hope of afterlife in the context of life beyond this planet. It is argued that the concept of ‘multiple realizability’ allows us to envision sentient life beyond this planet. Given Hilary Putnam’s contribution of the understanding of multiple realizability, it would be hard to defend the premise that we are the only conscious beings in the universe. It would be reasonable to envision consciousness not only as part of our carbon-based brains but also associated with non-carbon based life forms beyond this planet. We can envision consciousness not only being contingent on brain, grain and rain but also envision consciousness being non-contingent as we understand God to be. It is argued that the connection between sentient life and other sentient beings or between this life and the hereafter would have to be similar, if we are to communicate with other sentient beings or be aware of the connection between this life and afterlife. Questions that will be considered in the paper are: Can sentient life beyond this planet be the actualized in a different body? Can identity be persevered with a different body? Can sentient life here be multiple realized elsewhere while retaining the same consciousness? Can sentient beings define the difference between ‘what it is like’ to be contingent and ‘what is like’ to be non-contingent to each other. Can time be realized differently in different being?

Keywords: Afterlife, Consciousness, Sentience, Multiple Realization, Christian, Putnam, Chalmers
Consciousness is an emergent or a neural process of our carbon-based brains. However, how insentient matter becomes sentient, cognitive and subjective remains a mystery. David Chalmers refers to this as the ‘hard problems’ of consciousness. Even more mysterious is the Christian claim that there is an afterlife beyond this planet. We know that life beyond this planet requires a different body, one that is not necessarily carbon based. The Bible simply states that in the ‘twinkling of an eye’ a ‘new body’ will be given to those who choose eternal life. Can our sentient life be actualized in another body while retaining the same consciousness? Can identity be persevered with a different body? Can sentient life be multiply realized elsewhere in the universe? If there is consciousness elsewhere in the universe is it the same as ours? Would consciousness beyond this planet be contingent on brain, grain and rain or contingent on other factors? Could it be non-contingent? Can time be realized differently in different beings? Would the Christian concept of afterlife include the option to exit or die (as we have in this life)?

Can the Christian claim of afterlife be supported in contemporary thinking? Given the contribution of Hilary Putnam to the understanding of the concept of multiple realizability, it would be reasonable to argue that there could be life beyond this planet. We know that conscious life beyond this planet would require another body. As such, the only way we can argue for life beyond this planet is to accept the premise that consciousness can be realized in non-carbon based life forms. The question then is can we understand what life would be like without having a carbon based brain? While we are not sure of how our carbon based brains become aware, self-aware, or aware of other objects and subjects, we can indeed be reflective of what the mind is aware of independent of knowing what the mind is. In this paper we are not dealing with what the mind is, as David Chalmers would state, the ‘hard problems’ of consciousness but with the question of whether

---

2. David J. Chalmers, ‘Conceptual Analysis, Dualism and the Explanatory Gap’ 371. Philosophy of Mind, Whether consciousness is a neurophysiological process as U. T. Place argues, or a non-reductive emergent as Searle argues, it seems certain that it is contingent on the brain.
3. Chalmers, ‘Consciousness and its Place in Nature,’ Philosophy of Mind. (Oxford University Press: New York, 2002) 248. If turning water into wine is a miracle, what about the few glasses of insentient water in our carbon based brains that become sentient—aware of itself, self-aware and aware of other objects and subjects of our choice? We experience a miracle every day and every moment when we realize how God can make insentient matter become sentient minds. The big questions are how and when insentient matter becomes sentient, what is sentience, who is sentient, and why is there sentience at all?
4. 1 Corinthians 2:9; 15:52. (Holy Bible, King James Version n.d.)
6. Can there be non-contingent sentient life forms on other planets or is non-contingent life limited only to God? Further, would non-contingent beings need to believe in God?
7. All truths in the Bible cannot be verified as true or false. Some beliefs held can be verified (flood account), some beliefs held cannot be verified (creation account). Some beliefs held against scientific evidence (the age of the earth based on Bishop Ussher, and some beliefs can be held regardless of evidence (like accepting or rejecting the essence of God independent of the existence of God).
consciousness can be multiply realized in different parts of the universe, and what it would be like to be conscious in another body. What is striking about our carbon based consciousness is our existential awareness and our concerns related to what we are aware of\textsuperscript{13} the awareness of being, non-being and eternal being.

Before the 1950’s it was assumed that human life could not be sustained beyond this planet. However, when Alan Turing argued that mental states can be duplicated in machine states, the computational age\textsuperscript{14} saw the introduction of the concept of multiple realizability,\textsuperscript{15} whereby we learned that a lot of things that the carbon based brain can do can be duplicated in silicon based systems, such as calculation and storing of memory. The concept of multiple realizability, in principle, was introduced by Hilary Putnam\textsuperscript{16} in 1967, when he argued that pain can be multiply realized in different animals, depending on whether the pain states are from a mammalian, reptilian or mollusk’s brain.\textsuperscript{17} While some reductive materialists like U. T. Place\textsuperscript{18} tried to reduce pain states to particular neurophysiological states, others like non-reductive materialist Hilary Putnam argued that ‘pain’ states can be ‘indefinitely’ realized in many neurophysiological states. Similarly, it can be argued that brain states can be multiply realized in ‘extra-terrestrial beings.’ What are some of the implications of this? To begin with, if mental states, such as pain states and functional states such as calculation, can be multiply realized then is it possible for sentience or awareness itself to be realized in different beings in the universe, albeit differently. This concept of multiple realizability makes both the possibility of life beyond this planet a real possibility and the biblical claim of afterlife more acceptable and believable.

What is the significance of consciousness in the universe? Without sentience or awareness\textsuperscript{19} no state of being would have any meaning. The presence of consciousness makes it possible to question what we are aware of and understand our place in the universe. How or when we become sentient is not as important as the fact of being sentient and being aware of the content of our consciousness. If it is safe to assume that consciousness can be multiply realized in different parts of the universe differently—then will consciousness be the same regardless of whether it is carbon based or non-carbon based? Further, would consciousness be different if it were to be non-contingent as opposed to being contingent?

\textsuperscript{13}The big question is not whether consciousness a brain state, a functional state, or a behavioural disposition, but why we are aware of what we are aware of. We are indeed aware of a lot more than our desire to know what mental states are.\textsuperscript{14}Alan Turing,‘Computing Machinery and Intelligence,’\textit{Philosophy of Mind}, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004). Many thought experiments have been conducted to show different aspects of the body/mind problem. For example, the Turing Test, created by Alan Turing, the ‘Chinese Room’ created by John Searle, and the ‘China Brain’ experiment, created by Ned Block.\textsuperscript{15}Jaegwon,‘Multiple Realization and the Metaphysics of Reduction,’\textit{Philosophy of Mind}, (University Press: Oxford, 2004), 728.\textsuperscript{16}Putnam,‘Psychological Predicates,’ John Heil, \textit{Philosophy of Mind}, (New York: Oxford University Press 2004), 160.\textsuperscript{17}Ibid., 164.\textsuperscript{18}U. T. Place, \textit{Journal of Psychology}, 47: 44-50, (1956).\textsuperscript{19}What David Rosenthal (see Footnote 19) would call ‘state consciousness.’ Is it possible for phenomenal consciousness to be different but state consciousness be the same?
II

The reality of God would be the first sentient life beyond this planet to explore. We know by definition\textsuperscript{20} and revelation\textsuperscript{21} that God is non-contingent. Conceiving a non-contingent sentient being beyond this planet is the best example to show that sentience beyond this planet can be multiply realized in different parts of the universe. Sentience can be housed in a non-contingent body as well as in a contingent body. It would be unique to study the nature of consciousness both as a carbon and non-carbon based reality. Can creature and Creator share the same consciousness? Can sentience be the same\textsuperscript{22} while \textit{what it is like}\textsuperscript{23} to be human as opposed to what it is like to be God is different?\textsuperscript{24} Can contingent and non-contingent sentient beings define the difference between what it is like to be contingent and what is like to be non-contingent to each other? Can we assume that while the qualia of what it is to be God or human would be different, the state of being conscious would be the same. Even though we share the image of God with God, it is not possible to know what it is like to be God. We are sentient like God even though we are contingent and God is non-contingent.

Since we are created in God’s image it would be safe to assume that we share with God a common sentience that makes it possible for each to know who each is to the other. Martin Buber argues this when he states that God needs us just as much as we need Him.\textsuperscript{25} For if the creature is to acknowledge its Creator it would be necessary that the creature and the Creator have something in common that makes it possible for each to know who the other is. However, understanding God as the first being related to life beyond this planet does not mean that we also share with God the same carbon based brain. It is one thing to argue that we are sentient like God but another to argue that God shares a carbon based brain like us. The concept of multiple realizability allows us to accept the possibility of non-carbon based sentience. It is the presence of consciousness in the universe that is significant, regardless of whether it is carbon based or non-carbon based contingent or non-contingent. We can argue that consciousness itself can be realized in other forms other than a carbon based brain. God had to create creatures in His image if He was to be acknowledged as God. Who would God be to an atom or an ant? God can be God only to those who can acknowledge who God is. He would be God only to Adam. Why? Because only Adam could know who God is because only those who are created to know God

\textsuperscript{20}By definition God is immortal— According to Descartes, an immortal being is a being that cannot exist.
\textsuperscript{21}Knowing God as God wants us to know Him (‘Know that God is One’—Deut. 6:4).
\textsuperscript{23}Thomas Nagel, ‘What it is Like to be a Bat,’ \textit{Philosophy of Mind}, (New York: Oxford University Press 2002), 219-226. Here Nagel argues that only a bat can know what it is like to be a bat.
\textsuperscript{24}God became one of us to be ‘God with us.’ \textit{Philippians} 2:5-11. He became like us — was it to know what it is like to be human?
can know who God is. Here we have to assume that sentience in God and sentience in humans are the same, only realized differently.

III

The second possibility for sentient life would be to look for other contingent beings in the universe. If God is the only non-contingent sentient being in the universe, then other sentient beings would like us be contingent but unlike us have non-carbon based brains. We know our sentience is contingent on our carbon based brains, so if there is contingent sentient life beyond this planet then it would have to be realized in a different ‘brain.’ We know that our carbon based brain or sentient life cannot be sustained beyond this planet without brain, grain and rain. Again, it would be strange to argue that apart from us there are no other sentient beings in the universe. Many who have looked at the universe that is near us seem to agree that life as we experience it cannot be had on any planet near us simply because life as we know it cannot survive beyond this planet. But if life or sentient life can be multiply realized in other planets which are not like us then it is possible to envision sentient life beyond this planet that is non-carbon based. Celestial life beyond this planet entails that there would be other types of elements that can sustain life. In Thomas Negal’s thought experiment the Twin Earth, he introduced the idea that on Twin earth another liquid similar to water called ‘twater’ could sustains life. However Kripke would argue, that although this liquid is similar to water, it is not \( \text{H}_2\text{O} \), it is XYZ, hence not water. Similarly, can something that is like sentience that enables us to think, believe, choose, and know be sentience if it is not an emergence of a carbon-based brain? Kripke would argue that only water (H\(_2\)O) could be considered as water in all possible worlds. If that is the case, can sentient life be called sentient life if it is not carbon based? While it is true that only H\(_2\)O can be called water that does not mean only water can sustain life. Similarly something similar to sentience can be multiply realised in non-carbon based life and be like us contingent—but be contingent on something other than brain, grain and rain.

26 The concept of immortality simply defines that there is something that is birthless and deathless but the definition itself does not state that there has to be only one such reality. Belief that there is only one such being is a fact we come to know because God said so. ‘Know that your God is one.’ Duet 6: 4.

27 Putnam, ‘The Meaning of Meaning,’ *Philosophy of Mind*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), 584-585. Here Putnam argues that ‘meaning ain’t in the head.’ Nevertheless, one would argue that there would be other liquids like water that could sustain life.
The third possibility to explore would be related to the Christian hope of afterlife beyond this planet. If there is the possibility of afterlife beyond this planet as Christianity claims, then knowing what we know, that carbon based life cannot survive beyond this planet, afterlife would have to be non-carbon based. If we believe what the Bible states that we will be given a ‘new body’ it would be safe to conclude that afterlife beyond this planet would be non-carbon based but sentient. Whether it would be contingent as our present life is or it would be non-contingent as God’s life would involve speculation. Is a carbon based brain a necessary condition for consciousness or a sufficient condition like the need for oxygen, temperature and pressure is, to consciousness? Afterlife in Christianity is not simply about obtaining eternal life—it is about meeting the Eternal One.

This question of afterlife is a universal quest, tied up with the belief in God. It appears that those who are aware of God also are aware of afterlife and those who believe in afterlife also believe in God. Afterlife has to do with the creature meeting the Creator, if each is to know who each is to each other then there must be a common consciousness that makes it possible for each to know who each is. The meeting of the creature with the Creator is fundamental to the understanding of afterlife in Christianity.

The Bible states two things about afterlife: Believers would be given ‘new bodies’ and that it would happen ‘in a twinkling of an eye.’ But because of the question ‘how does a new body retain the same person?’ many have commented on what the afterlife or resurrection might be. Some have suggested that it is the resurrection of the old body as in the case of Lazarus; Paul Tillich argues for what John Hick calls the recapitulation of humans, that Man’s immortality is the eternal presence of his earthly life within the divine memory. Hartshorne argues that our immortality can only be God’s omniscience of us in that all of humanity lives on in ‘divine consciousness’ after death. The question that interests us all is, ‘Can the new body retain the old person?’ The Bible is clear when it says that the resurrection is a recreation of the self with a ‘new body,’ not the resuscitation of the old body or the restoration of the old body. It is the recreation of the

---

24Since we are mortal we consider God the being who would provide the escape from death. Is it possible that if we were immortal that humans would consider God as the being who would provide an escape from life not an escape for death?
25Afterlife in Christianity is not simply to live forever, or obtain eternal life but to meet the Eternal One. It has to do with the creature meeting the Creator. Some religions, such as Hinduism, do not argue for such a meeting.
26Even though there are examples in the Bible of resurrection of the child and the story of Lazarus.
30Hick, Death and Eternal Life.
311 Corinthians (Holy Bible, King James Version n.d.).
same person with a new body. How can the new body have the same self? Multiple realization allows for both the realization and actualization of self/consciousness in different possible worlds. It is the regaining of self-consciousness and continuing the same life with a new body that has taught the imagination of all.

V

What role does consciousness play in understanding the relationship between body, space and time? Sentience is what makes understanding of the nature of being possible. While all bodies occupy space and have location in time, consciousness, the very essence of being, has neither place nor location. Husserl believed that the essence of consciousness is intentionality, which is understanding existence as being other than its being. Sartre argued for the immateriality of consciousness in that consciousness is real but not a thing. So it is difficult to argue for the presence or absence of something that is not a thing, even though it is tied up with the thing called the brain. Martin Heidegger argued that Dasein—being there in the context of existentiality, sociality and temporality—being there in time. Do all beings have a beginning? Beginning implies being but being does not imply beginning. There are two kinds of realities—realities that have a beginning and realities that do not have a beginning. Realities such as triangles and circles are considered as beginningless, but we know that without minds we cannot conceive of such realities then there must be an eternal or beginningless mind in which such realities exist. That is why we can say that triangles and circles, like God, are neither birthless nor deathless—and that there is no such thing as the birth or death of a triangle.

But beings that have a beginning have their beginning ‘in the beginning’ either by an intelligent sentient Creator

36 Can the butterfly know what it is like to be a caterpillar? No. Non-sentient/non-human beings live only in the present. They cannot remember the past or plan their future their past. Hence a butterfly cannot know what it was like to be a caterpillar. Human consciousness has the capacity to know the past, present and vision the future can know.

37 The Egyptians argued for preservation of the body as the preparation for afterlife; the Hindus argue for reincarnation and repetition of life based on laws of Karma; the Greeks argued for the bodiless existence. Scientists would argue for the replication of the body as in cloning. Some argue that life is cyclic in that life is a repetition of our past life.

38 Jean Paul Sartre, Being and Nothingness,(New York: Washington Square Press,1977), 21. What is consciousness? To Sartre it is real but not a thing. ‘All consciousness is consciousness of something.’


40 Ibid., 79.

41 Without which we cannot understand the relationship between being, time and space. What is consciousness? What are mental states?

42 Physicalists, like Daniel Dennett argue that there are no mental states, all states are neurophysiological states. Reductive materialists like U. T. Place argue that there are mental states but they can be reduced to neurophysiological states. Non-reductive materialists like Hilary Putnam argue that since ‘pain’ states can be ‘indefinitely’ realized in many neurophysiological states, (depending on whether the mental states are from a mammalian, reptilian or mollusk’s brain) as such he argues that consciousness is non-reductive. See bibliography for source information.


45 Sartre, Being and Nothingness, 28.

46 Heidegger, Being and Time, 182. Being- in- the- world— in short being-there—Dasein.Dasein is not only characterized by existentiality (BT225) but sociality hence the need for concern /care—the German word ‘sorge’ (BT237).

47 Ibid., 418.
as the Christian paradigm suggests or from a single unintelligent insentient cell as the scientific paradigm suggests. In *Being and Time* Heidegger points out that we know time because we know we are going to die.\(^{47}\) He states that ‘the end of being-in-the-world is death.’\(^{48}\) As such, time begins to tick one moment at a time for beings who are aware of being and non-being. While time begins one moment at a time for beings that have a beginning, there is no ‘first’ or ‘last’ moment of time.\(^{49}\) Time is divided into past, present\(^{50}\) and future only for sentient beings who are aware of the being/non-being, space and time.

VI

The contemporary world’s interest in questions related to ‘life beyond this planet’ helps us understand the traditional beliefs related to afterlife. The virtual world has a part to play. The recent movies that feature ‘life beyond this planet’ suggest that there are some commonalities between us and life beyond this planet. One of the main questions asked is, ‘what would the nature of consciousness be for ‘life beyond this planet?’’ Would we share a common consciousness?\(^{51}\) If so, does life beyond this planet require a carbon based brain? Since the birth of computers we know many mental states or functions of the mind can be multiply realized\(^{52}\) in non-carbon based systems. We have made silicon based systems\(^{53}\) do things like calculation and memory like what our carbon based brains do. If we can make non-carbon based systems do things that carbon based brains do, is it possible to argue that consciousness could also be multiply realized in non-carbon based life forms? The Bible states that believers would be given a new body that is incorruptible.\(^{54}\) Of course, the question to ask would be is afterlife subject to death? The bible seems to suggest that afterlife is not subject to death—hence afterlife is considered as eternal life.\(^{55}\) Now we realize we not only can talk about ‘life beyond this planet,’ but also talk about the possibility of consciousness ‘multiply realized’ in different non-carbon based life forms. Perhaps we may communicate with them. The interest in ‘life beyond this planet’ has made the belief in afterlife much more real. The concept of multiple realizability helps understand the biblical statement ‘new body’ to

\(^{47}\)Stumpf, *From Socrates to Sartre*, 507.
\(^{48}\)Heidegger, *Being and Time*, 276-77.
\(^{50}\)Heidegger, *Being and Time*, 188.
\(^{51}\)Without a common consciousness we cannot communicate with extra-celestial beings. Even on earth it appears that each species tends to only communicate with its kind.
\(^{53}\)Ned Block and Robert Stalkner, ‘Concepts of Consciousness’ *Philosophy of Mind*, 211.
\(^{54}\)1 Corinthians 2:9. (Holy Bible, King James Version n.d.)
\(^{55}\)John 3:16. (Holy Bible, King James Version n.d.)
mean that much of our experience can be ‘multiply realized’ in the next life. And even more importantly, we may experience a ‘new life’ in a ‘new body’ ‘in the twinkling of an eye.’

If one is to understand the concept of multiple realizability in the context of the biblical claim of afterlife we will find that the biblical claim is metaphysically or logically possible because the concept of ‘multiple realizability’ gives credence to what the Bible states of having a ‘new body.’ The metaphysical possibility of having a new body in the hereafter is easier to accept than the physical or nomological possibility of life beyond this planet with the old body—knowing what we know that our present body cannot exit beyond this planet. Sentience attached with a new body as the Bible argues is metaphysically possible because continuation of sentience outside this planet with the old body is not physically possible.

56 Speaking of afterlife from a Christian viewpoint, one could argue for the resurrection of a new body (1 Corinthians 15:44).
57 1 Corinthians 15:52. (Holy Bible, King James Version n.d.).
58 Mental states are considered as being multiply realizable—both Putman and Kim argue that since the mental state of pain can be multiply realized in a variety of organisms it is possible to multiply realize consciousness in many life forms.
Bibliography


‘Holy Bible.’ King James Version. n.d.


On Bataille’s Thought of Consumption — Exemplified by the Offerings in Shang Dynasty

Department of General Educational Center
The University of Arts in Taipei
Associate Professor
Dr. Wu Huai-Chen

This article aims to discuss Georges Bataille’s concept of consumption and interpret it by the examples of religious sacrifice in Shang dynasty. First part of this paper will reveal the huge scale of human and animal sacrifices that recorded in Oracle and offered in Shang Kings’ tombs. The great deal of funerary offerings may be regarded as the ostentatious destruction as potlatch-like feast. The second part of this article will illuminate Bataille’s thought of consumption. Bataille believed that “death taboo” and “sex taboo” are the intermediaries between “sacred world” and “profane world”. Through violating taboos, the way to consume energy or wealth, human beings can transgress from profane to the sacred world. He had presented the concept of consumption to explain the significance of Sun god sacrifice in Aztec empire. Thus, this article holds that the Bataille’s thought can be used to explain sacrificially ostentatious destruction in Shang civilization, and this interpretation could be an original research for the ancient Chinese religious study.

Keywords: Bataille, Consumption, Shang Dynasty, Sovereignty, The Sacred, Human Sacrifice

“When we see an ancient society willing and able to devote considerable wealth for seemingly useless tasks, we would admire its people and call them civilized. The more wasteful they are, the greater their civilization looms in our eyes.” 張光直, 毛小雨譯, 《商代文明》, 北京：北京工藝美術出版社, 1999 年，頁 352。
Part One

1. A Piece of Turtleback < No.124>

<Chinese archaeological report> turtleback no.124 recorded: The divination scripts divined: Should thousands of humans and cows be offered sacrifice while the ritual was being held? After the ruins of the Yin dynasty were excavated and oracle-bone-scripts were revealed in 1928. A brief outline of the variety and amounts of the offerings in Shang dynasty was drawn. The types of Shang offerings include cows, goats, pigs, dogs and humans. The amounts of the offerings vary from one to thousands as the above-mentioned divination scripts recorded.

The record of turtleback no.124 gave descendants a thorough vision on the scale of the offerings — how to carry out the slaughter of thousands of cows and humans? And Shang people must have a certain method to manage the humans and animals. But why would Shang people waste large number of fortune, humans and livestock on such religious affairs?

2. Civilization — The Accumulation and Consumption of Fortune

Shang dynasty was the earliest dynasty of Chinese civilization. In the book <Art, Myths
and Ceremonies> written by Kwang-Chih Chang —“The development of Chinese civilization accompanied dynasties, as all other areas, because civilization is but a symbol of accumulation of fortune for a small number of people—the dynasty.”

According to oracle-bone-scripts, I am sure that the fortune of Shang dynasty was absolutely accumulated and relatively gathered up on the emperor of Shang. Thus, the emperor of Shang, his princes, dukes and concubines, the few people who were in possession of the fortune in the society of Shang dynasty. They accumulated the fortune over central China so that the Shang civilization and its dynasty was therefore born.

Shang dynasty has been considered one that worshiped the ghosts, which was proved by 2 evidences: 1. More than 10,000 pieces of bones and tortoise shells remains were dug out from underground. 2. All the past Shang emperors’ graves showed that the emperors almost divined everything everyday. The mortuary objects showed that the Shang emperors served the deaths as if they served the lives. K.C. Chang’s question continues: Why would people who were in possession of the fortune waste goods and materials on seemingly useless affairs?

3. The Emperor of Shang – The Political King of The Real World

3,000 years ago, there were many kingdoms on the central Chinese continent. But Shang was apparently the most prominent one in that era. The emperor of Shang was the shared king of all vassal kingdoms at that time. All fortune was centered on the emperor of Shang.

Among the goods and materials that the Emperor had in hand, bronze ware was the most notable. To manufacture bronze ware requires a large number of labor and material. First, to dig out minerals needs a great deal of labor enduring high temperature at the mining area and knowing the mines’ directions well. Bronze ware was a symbol of political power and its main purpose is for offerings and wars—“Offering sacrifices to the gods or the spirits of the dead and military affairs are major issues of a country.” —左傳

4. The Emperor of Shang – The Religious King of The Real World

Not only was the emperor of Shang the political king, but also he was the religious king. According to the oracle inscriptions, only the emperor was entitled to predict. Besides, the oracle inscriptions decreed that the emperor danced to pray for rain and divined by interpreting dreams. These were not only the emperors’ but also the wizards’ activities, which indicates clearly that the emperor was also a wizard. The emperor was the leader of the wizards.

The emperors of Yin even scorched the tortoises for divination themselves.

The cellar caves, where the used oracle bones were hidden. The cellar cave – pit H127 was dug out during the archaeological excavation in Anyang in 1963. 17,096 pieces of oracle bones were found in the pit that was about 3 level ground. And just merely the totality of 24,918 pieces of them was found in the ruins of Yin dynasty. Plus a skeleton of human body, who could possibly be the custodian of the oracle bones, was buried together.

5. The Emperor of Shang – The King of Underworld
Shang people believed that the emperors’ reign will continue in underworld after their deaths. Modern Chinese was greatly astonished by the system of burying the living with the dead when the imperial tomb of Yin dynasty came out of the excavation. Firstly by the huge buildings of the imperial tomb, secondly by large quantities of sacrificial objects and thirdly by a large number of human corpses buried in it, which proved that human sacrifices prevailed over Shang dynasty.

Tomb M1001

There were 10 major tombs, 1,200 minor tombs and burial pits. M1001 should be a better choice for us to experience the momentum and the scale of a Shang imperial tomb.

Through the picture and numbers, we can imagine the tremendous construction and labor to build an imperial tomb. A large number of humans and animal were buried in M1001. 252 human bodies, whom were estimated to be wives, courtiers, bodyguards and slaves of the emperor were found. The slaves were dragged to appropriate places in the tomb with hands tied behind back in groups and kneeled side by side with faces towards the burial pits.

Around the 11 major imperial tombs, a lot of “burial pits row” were dug out among
1,259 minor tombs. Inside each square pit in each row buried 10 chopped-off skulls, which are called “the beheaded-head-pits”. This kind of offering activity that handles humans and animals by separating heads and bodies became the “felling” and “fitting” in oracle-bone-scripts.

6. The Bronze Ware at The Tomb of Fu-Hao

After the tomb of Fu-Hao, a middle-sized tomb that had never been coveted by graverobbers, was excavated in 1976, a grand occasion of the fortune of Shang dynasty was described. Fu-Hao, the wife of Yin Emperor -Wu Ding, was titled grand general and leaded troops to go to wars. The mortuary objects that buried with her reached a total of 1,928 items, including 460 bronze items, 755 jade items and 63 stoneware items, which covered a wide range of variety with high quality. “Burying a large number of bronze ware with the deceased emperors should be considered a sort of religious behavior which offered the deceased to enjoy in the underworld, It should also be considered a sort of conspicuous destruction, such as the potlatch-like grand banquets”, K.C. Chang described the sacrificial bronze ware.

7. Why to Abandon Such Enormous Fortune?

Two Questions
1. If offering, divining and burying sacrificial objects with the dead were all useless, why would civilization develop from the fact that a few number of people held major fortune but waste it on religious matters of no use?
2. The centralized fortune in Shang dynasty was a universal circumstance among all civilizations’ progression where the answers can be found in. In part two, George Bataille’s thought of consumption will be discussed to explain “the use of the useless” to the origin of civilizations.

Part 2

1. Utility

In the theory of general economy, Bataille also talked about the material system. He thought that when people have the clear sense to distinguish between the egos and the external world and then classify outside things one after another. Therefore substances will be able to gain certain positions and furthermore obtain value and utility in the meantime. Bataille said that humans dominated and subordinated objects in the beginning. But as the world moves on, humans can also be a part of the tools that dominates mankind as well.

2. World of Things and the Profane World (Monde Des Choses and Monde Profane)

After a certain system of the substances been built with “utilities” by humans, the material world (or “Monde Profane” called by Bataille) was developed. Whether it’s the primitive social stage or the modern era of incomparable complex value system, values in
circulation usually means “exchange of equal value”. Bataille thought this is the circulating relationship of homogeneity.

3. Taboo -Sex and Death

In animal world, certain power, such as sex and death, is so wild and violent that the human-socialized steady life will be destroyed if it is brought into the material world. In order to resist the destructive power of sex and death, sex and death were delimited as interdit in the profane world. The most intense interdiction in sex is incest. And the most intense interdiction in death are blood and corpses. However, Bataille interpreted human interdictions through Hagel’s viewpoint on “aufheben”. He thought that people fear sex and death on one hand, but deep down they are actually attracted and tempted to these kinds of interdictions, which is denied denial. People are anxiously fascinated to such lethal temptation. They feel anxiety and temptation at the same time and couldn’t resist to transgression the interdictions.

Bataille said that once people break such interdictions, they will enter the profound and successive world of chaos. –therefore “Monde Sacré” is opened.

4.“The Sacred World (Monde Sacré)”

Sacred things keep people from obedience to this world. People are fascinated with the sacred world but the helpless fear in the sacred world is beyond words. People desire yet fear the sacred world in order to resist the insufficiency of the orderly profane world. However, “what we want most is what exhausts us and puts our life in danger.”

5. The Emperor

The emperor is also a part of the interdictions. It is said that Chi, the first ancestor of Shang dynasty, was born of a young maiden who swallowed a fallen egg of a black bird. Thus, it is believed that the emperor carries some kind of evil power with him. He is taboo and will bring death if others draw near. This is the first reason why the fortune was absolutely accumulated and centered on the emperor at the beginning of the civilization.

6. The Use of The Useless

The emperor consumes instead of produces, simply digests and destroys materials. From an economical perspective, this kind of behavior, which was called “consumation” by Bataille, breaks off the utilitarian circuit of produce-consume-reproduce. Consumation appears to be completely useless.

When bronze ware was abandoned along with the emperors’ death, K.C.Chang called it “conspicuous destruction”. The 1,625 kilograms of great fortune at the tomb of Fu-Hao were verily useless conspicuous destruction to the common people who kept laboring in life.

7. Consumption –The Sovereignty
Beyond the useful consumption marked the sovereignty, the opposite of the servility, said Bataille. The emperor went beyond the utilities and the sovereignty was embodied in the emperor -the sovereign himself. Therefore the ancient emperors were the beings with the sovereignty and the sanctity.

8. The Initial Consumption -Sacrifice

At certain festivals, people decided to consume innumerable products, grain or livestock, which they produced with hard work, as sacrificial offerings in a wasteful way. Sacrifice became the source of consumption.61

9. The Aztec Documents

In the book « the accursed share », Bataille referred to what the 16th-century missionary priest, Bernardino de Sahagún wrote down about the Aztec kings and human and animal sacrifices. « The Aztecs sacrificed a large number of life, mostly war prisoners, in sun-god festivals. The prisoners sang and danced with their owners and were filled with alcohol until dead drunk before their death. In general, 20,000 humans and animals were sacrificed at the annual festivals.

10. Objects in Sacrifices –Humans and Animals

Speaking of human sacrifices, «The issue, which was not to slaughter but merely to abandon, appeared the dimension of pure gifting. Offering sacrifices was a kind of gifting « pure gifting ». For the humans who were taken for sacrificial offerings, the victims were the surplus
value that was chosen from a great deal of useful fortune. Excluding such sacrificial offerings is for being consumed profitlessly. Thus it had been entirely destroyed. Once one had been chosen, he/she became the accursed share and was destined to be consumed violently. However, the curse dragged him/her away from the system of things. The curse gave him/her an approved role that sent out the intimacy, anguish, the profundity of living beings.

Bibliography

Chinese Books

《侯家莊第二本1001號大墓》梁思永遺稿、高去尋輯補, 歷史語言研究所, 1962年。
《中國上古史》中央研究院歷史語言研究所中國上古史編輯委員會編, 台北, 中央研究院歷史語言研究所, 1985年。
《小屯第二本殷墟文字丙編(上輯)》張秉權, 歷史語言研究所, 1957、1959年。
《小屯第二本殷墟文字丙編(中輯)》張秉權, 歷史語言研究所, 1962、1965年。
《美術、神話與祭祀》張光直, 郭淨譯, 台北: 稻香出版社, 1993年。
《中國青铜時代》張光直, 台北: 聯經出版社, 2002年。
《商代文明》張光直, 毛小雨譯, 北京: 北京工藝美術出版社, 1999年。
《傅斯年卷》劉夢溪編, 石家庄市: 河北教育出版社, 1996年。
《董作賓卷》劉夢溪編, 石家庄市: 河北教育出版社, 1996年。
《李濟卷》劉夢溪編, 石家庄市: 河北教育出版社, 1996年。
《殷墟婦好墓》中國社會科學院考古研究所, 北京: 文物出版社, 1980年初版, 1985年再版。
《巴塔耶: 消盡》湯淺博雄, 趙英譯, 石家庄市: 河北教育, 2001年。
《商代神話》陳夢家等, 台北: 天一出版社, 1991年。
《殷墟卜辭綜述》陳夢家, 北京: 中華出版社, 1988年。
《中國古代文化》白川靜, 范月嬌譯, 台北: 文津出版社, 1983年。
《甲骨文的世界: 古殷王朝的綱構》白川靜, 溫天河、蔡哲茂譯, 台北, 1977年。
《色情史》巴塔耶, 劉暉譯, 北京: 商務出版社, 1993年。
《形上史論》譚家哲, 台北: 唐山出版, 2006年。
《阿茲特克: 太陽與血的民族》Serge Gruzinski, 馬振騁譯, 上海: 漢語大辭典出版社, 2001年。
《商代中期的人祭制度研究---以鄭州小雙橋商代遺址的人祭遺存為例》馬季凡, 《中原文物》, 2004年第三期。
《甲骨文中有关獵首風俗的記載》黃天樹, 《中國文化研究》夏之卷, 2005年。
《甲骨文「伐」字資料反映「獵首」風俗商榷》劉海琴, 《傳統中國研究集刊》第二輯, 2007年。
《探討癌末處境「聖世界」的形成》余德慧、石世明、夏淑怡, 《生死學研究》第三卷, 2006年。
《禮物的美學：藝術經濟理論的新主張》路易士.海德, 吳佳綺譯, 臺北市: 城邦文化出版, 2008年。
《禮物：舊社會中交換的形式與功能》牟斯著，汪珍宜、何翠萍譯，台北市：遠流，1989年。
《文學與惡》喬治·巴塔耶著，澄波、陳慶浩譯，臺北市：國立編譯館，1997年。
《獵首、儀式與族群關係：以阿里山鄒族 mayasvi 為例》邵碩芳，台東：國立台東大學南島文化研究所碩士論文，2008年。

French Books


English Books

   1955. Lascaux; or, the Birth of Art, the Prehistoric Paintings. Lausanne: AustrynWainhouse. 1955.


To Each His God: A Vedantic Approach to Religion

Ranjan Kumar Singh, India

Abstract

Vedanta refrains from giving God any name, singular or plural. If ever Vedanta has to refer to the God, it refers to it as Tat, meaning ‘That’, the one which is beyond our perceptions. By not associating it with any form and name, it has made ‘That’ independent of gender. ‘That’ is neither a male nor a female, less of all a Hindu, Muslim or a Christian. If ever ‘That’ must be called by a name, it has been called so as the Brahman or Param-atman, the Supreme Self. As matter is the continuum of the space, so is the Atman (Self) a continuum of the Param-atman. The trilogy of Space, Energy and Time has been referred to as the Param-Atman, Para-Shakti and Para-Brahman in Vedanta. What Space is to Science, or Infinity to Mathematics, Brahman is to Vedanta. It is the same as the Shoonya of the Buddhists or Ether of Aristotle. The Brahman thus conceived by Vedanta is well defined and yet totally unidentified, thereby making it convenient for all to conceive ‘That’ in one’s own unique way. Thus Vedanta presents us with a perfect picture frame and leaves it onto us to slip in the desired photograph.

Introduction

But for Hinduism, perhaps there is no religion that gives us the liberty of choosing our own God. And Hinduism is not a religion. A religion by its very nature is authoritative. This authority comes from a single God, a unique Scripture and a widely respected Religious-head. Hinduism has too many of these. With no absolute authority, there cannot be a religion. In fact, the nomenclature Hindu does not refer to any belief. Instead it refers to a location. Hindu is a distortion of Sindhu or the Indus River along which these people lived. Consequently, their way of life was termed Hinduism.
Remarkably, the way of life of these people was influenced by a collection of *Samhitas* or verses called the *Vedas*. These were not written scriptures, but verbal communiqués that transcended generations. There were four of these – the *Rig Veda*, the *Yajura Veda*, the *Sama Veda* and the *Atharva Veda*. Subsequently these *Vedas* were further elaborated and the appended portion was called the *Vedanta*. While *Vedas* related to the nature of the outer world, *Vedanta* related to the nature of inner world. Together these formed the most comprehensive knowledge base.

*Vedanta* continues to be relevant as the truth of the inner world has not changed. Even the advancements of science and technology have failed to contradict the facts put forward by our Great Seers, who had realized the truth in their own unique way. Of all the knowledge transcending down the generations, the *Upanishads* are of paramount importance as these expounded the doctrine of *Karma*, which was fully established later in the *Bhagavad Gita* and which still continues to be the essence of Indian Philosophy.

**Universal Appeal of Upanishads**

The beauty of the *Upanishads* is in its universal appeal. The scripture, as such, not only serves Hinduism, but also other religions like Jainism, Buddhism and Sikhism, whereas it itself retains its secular identity. The scripture in its very nature is purely humanitarian. In fact, it refrains even from giving the God any name. If ever the *Vedanta* has to refer to the God, it refers to it as *Tat* (That). By not associating it with any form and name, *Vedanta* has made ‘That’ independent of gender or religion.

The Vedanta identifies the God not by noun, but by adjectives. If ever ‘That’ must be called by a name, it has been called so as the *Ishwara*, the one who rules over; the one who commands. The Ishwara thus conceived by the Vedanta is well defined and yet totally unidentified, thereby making it convenient for all to conceive ‘That’ in one’s own unique
way. Vedanta presents us with a perfect picture frame and leaves it onto us to slip in the desired photograph. So it is for us to put in the picture of our choice, be it that of Vishnu or Shiva, Buddha or Jesus. We may even leave the frame blank if we like.

**Exploration of ‘You’ and ‘I’**

Our pursuit of knowledge sets us on the path of exploration of ‘You and I’. The first question that often occupies our mind is ‘Who am I?’ followed by another question ‘How am I related to you?’ This ‘you’ is certainly not specific to any individual, but to all others that we think is other than the self, be it other beings, the Universe or the God. Therefore to know the ‘self’ and ‘all other than the self’ becomes our very quest. The Vedanta is all about this quest of knowledge. It is an exploration of the *Atman* (Self) in relation to *Paramatman* (Supreme Self). It is an exploration of ‘our’ life herein and hereafter. It is our quest to find a common denominator between all life sources.

**The Law of Cause and Effect**

The science rules that there must be a cause behind an effect. The Universe came into effect because of a big bang; human beings came into effect because of the evolution of life. In his treatise Physics, Aristotle (384 BC – 322 BC) argued that everything that happens is caused by something else. So if you get wet because of a rain pour, what caused the rain? Obviously a combination of excessive moisture in the air and cold temperatures — but what caused the humidity? What caused the temperature drop? The questions can go on and on — everything that causes something is in turn caused by something else. We can trace this chain of causes back as far as we want, but Aristotle thought that eventually we reach a first cause that just was — causing but itself uncaused. He called it the ‘Prime Mover’. It is amazing to think that almost five centuries before Aristotle the learned seers of Vedanta had arrived at the same conclusion.
The Cause of All Causes

What has been termed as the ‘Prime Mover’ by Aristotle was referred to as ‘the Cause of all causes’ in the Vedanta. Definitely not all occurrences can be interpreted in terms of cause and effect – it is just impossible to determine if the hen came into being first or was it the egg to arrive first? None of us can answer this with certainty. However hard we may think, the question remains unsolved. Sooner or later we had to realize that all solutions cannot be got from the external world. In fact these Seers were quick to realize the failure of the sensuous knowledge. They declared, “There the eye cannot go; nor can the speech reach”\textsuperscript{ii}. Yet, they did not give up. They ventured into the inner world to seek such answers and retorted to the super-sensual knowledge to solve these problems.

Therefore they were forced to accept the presence of the Prime Cause – the Cause behind all causes! According to Vedanta, ‘That’ is the Eye of our eyes; the Ear of our ears; and the Mind of our mind\textsuperscript{iii}, because neither the eyes can see all by itself, or the ears can hear by itself; nor the mind can think on its own. For want of an identity, they called ‘That’ the \textit{Ishwara}, the Supreme Administrator.

Beyond Perception

Fact of the matter is that the \textit{Ishwara} till date remains unseen. The reference to God as ‘That’ has special significance. Grammatically, we refer to something which is away from us as ‘that’, whereas something that is near to us is referred to as ‘this’. Similarly, in Vedanta, Tat (That) signifies something which is beyond our perception, and Etat (This) signifies something which is perceivable.

We perceive anything through our five senses. Now we can neither see ‘That’, nor hear or touch ‘That’. ‘That’ also remains beyond our taste and smell. We can see a person and can also hear and touch it. With our limited power to smell, we can hardly smell it, but a dog can...
still smell it with distinction. We can smell a flower and also see and touch it, but we cannot hear it and thus believe that it does not have speech. Men can think, whereas others cannot. Even all men cannot see, hear, smell, feel or think alike. Thus in a way our perception is restrained by our senses. Wouldn’t we be a different person if we could have the power to see as that of a hawk, the power to smell as that of a bear, the power to hear as that of a cat, the power to feel through touch as that of a snake, the power to taste as that of a catfish, and the power of mind or the brain as developed as that of Einstein!

It all sounds utopian, but it allows us to think that our perception would certainly be improved if we had such enhanced capabilities. Could we then perceive ‘That’? It is indeed difficult to say. This is because even with its most developed vision a hawk would have its limitation; even with its most developed hearing power a cat would have its constraint; even with its most developed smelling power a bear would have its inadequacy; even with its most developed touch organs a snake would have its shortcoming; even with its most developed taste buds a catfish would have its drawback; and even with a brain as developed as that of Einstein we would still be bound.

**Super-sensuous Experience**

Science does not believe in the existence of anything that cannot be perceived. So it is an end of the matter with respect to God for science. The journey of philosophy begins from where the journey of science terminates. It still tries to perceive which remains imperceptible. Taking the standpoint of science further that every effect has a cause behind it, philosophy tries to explore that Prime Cause, which may not have a cause for its own existence, in other words, which is self-existing. It still may be an imagination, but what it takes to imagine! Perhaps if our senses were not limited, we could have perceived ‘That’. The Vedanta claims
that we can indeed develop our senses so as to perceive ‘That’. This can be done by *Sadhana* or meditation.

For us it took million of years to evolve from lowest species to human beings. Aided by the Mother Nature our journey has been from imperfection towards perfection. We may still be far from perfect, but the journey continues. Even if we were to leave this process of evolution in the hands of Mother Nature, we shall definitely be an improved being in course of time. But then it would again take million of years for us to evolve into a perfect being. Thankfully, we can now be the agents of evolution for our own self. Aided by the biological process of the nature we would take million of years to evolve into a perfect being, but aided by our own psycho-social potentials we may take far less time to achieve this. The quest for truth is same as the quest for perfection. Thus, it would not be totally incorrect to imagine that we can indeed develop our senses to perceive ‘That’.

**Unique Experience**

Obviously, ‘That’ thus perceived remains unique to the seers. The seer here does not refer to the soothsayer or the clairvoyant, but to the one who has seen or witnessed the ultimate truth. Even if they were to share their experience, it would be difficult for others to understand it. Thus, taking cue from such seers, we have to realize the ultimate truth all by ourselves. Realization - that is what it is! It needs a different set of sense organs to realize what remains imperceptible through our normal senses. Thus, the persons who could experience the ultimate were called the realized Souls. Ishwara or God or Allah cannot be perceived, but can be realized. Thus, what remains imperceptible by scientific values becomes known by faith and belief. This realization is indeed a solitary experience rather than a collective experiment.

**Space-Time-Energy**
Scientifically speaking the only thing that we can think of as all-pervasive is perhaps the Space. It is formless, indivisible, inseparable, unmade and indestructible. Even science cannot ignore this fact that whatever exists, exists in the space. Nothing exists beyond the Space – no living or non-living being, no star, no galaxy! Space extends further beyond the farthest. It is all-pervasive and omnipresent. It is perhaps the only element that is neither created nor destroyed. Scientists could make gases in their laboratories, they could manufacture artificial limbs, they could even clone living beings, they could indeed divide molecules into atoms; they could split atoms into electrons, protons and neutrons; they could trace Higgs Boson, but none of them could ever produce the Space, least of all destroy it. While we say that we have created some space in our home or office, all we mean is that we have redefined the pre-existing Space horizontally or vertically.

In fact nothing is created or destroyed in nature, it merely changes form. To quote Einstein, “Energy cannot be created or destroyed; it can only be changed from one form to another.” What is correct for physical energy, can it be incorrect for cosmic energy? Wasn’t the Great Scientist merely reiterating the eternal truth stated by the greatest of all Philosophers Sri Krishna, “Certainly never at any time I did not exist, nor did you or all these kings; and certainly we shall all never cease to exist in the future”iv? We can think of Sri Krishna, together with others, as the Energy personified. Elaborating it further, Sri Krishna states, “As a person discards an old worn out clothe to put on a new one, similarly the embodied gives up its old and worn out exterior to acquire a new one”v. The embodied is nothing else but the Cosmic Energy encaged within the body of flesh and blood.

With this we are introduced to yet another aspect, that of Energy. But is the Energy apart from Space? In fact the two aspects, space and energy, together with the third aspect, that of Time, are intertwined together, so much so that none can exist without the other two.
Interestingly these three aspects have been described as Paramatman, Parashakti and Parabramhan in the Vedas. It would be thought that these are same as the Trinity of Brahma-Vishnu-Mahesh, but actually these are the three aspects of one and only Brahma, who is Swambhu (self-existing) as Paramatman, Sat-Chid-Anand (the Ultimate Blissful Consciousness) as Parashakti; and Sarvavyapi (omnipresent) as Parabramhan. In other words, Bramhan is as omnipresent as the Space; as Omnipotent as the Energy; and as eternal as the Time. Bramhan is not beyond space and time as stated by modern Indian Philosophers; It is in fact the Time and Space as conceived by the Vedantic Philosophers. Thus, what was documented by the Great Scientists of the West had already been narrated by the Great Seers of the East!

The same Bramhan in its Paramatman aspect plays the role of Brahma (notBramhan), Vishnu and Mahesh or Shiva as creator, preserver and Annihilator respectively. Incidentally, the names Brahma, Vishu and Mahesh or Shiva do not figure in the Vedas or the Vedanta. These are obviously derived from the three aspects of Bramhan. Jeeva, in Vedanta, has been referred to as the Self and with respect to the Self,Bramhan is seen as the Supreme Self. This Supreme Self, itself being uncaused, is the cause of all causes.

According to Swami Vivekananda, “There is really no difference between matter, mind and spirit. They are only different phases of experiencing the One, The very world is seen by the five senses as matter, by the very wicked as hell, by the good as haven, and by the perfect as God”\textsuperscript{vi}.

As matter is the continuum of the space, so is the Atman a continuum of the Paramatman or the Supreme Self. Vedanta calls the Paramatman, the Bramhan. What Space is to science, or Infinity to Mathematics, Bramhan is to Vedanta. Absoluteness is its very virtue. It is the same as the Shoonya of the Buddhists or Ether of Aristotle. According to Vedanta, the
Bramhan becomes perceptible because of Maya (Illusion) and is thence called the Jeeva or Jagat. As we do not perceive the Space, but the wall; similarly we do not perceive the Bramhan, but the Jeeva. This makes the Jeeva appear real. To quote Albert Einstein, "Reality is merely an illusion, albeit a very persistent one." As the matter is part of the Space, so is the Jeeva part of the Bramhan – the Part that the Bramhan chooses to illumine or manifest. As an atom has the potential of becoming a cell, so has the Jeeva or Atman the potential of becoming the Bramhan or the Paramatman.

**Search for Perfection**

According to Vedanta, we all are indeed God, “AhamBramhanAsmi” (I am Bramhan). What then made us have God/s in the temples? People have a deep urge to seek divine interventions at the time of crisis. We want to pay homage to someone, whom we can call at such time. We need a deity whom we can worship. The world around us is full of imperfections, so we look around for perfection. Seeing none, we attributed all virtues in our personal God and see no vices in it. To us, being the absolute, ‘That’ is far from imperfections. When it remains an impersonal God it is the Bramhan, and when it becomes a personal God, it is the Ishwara.

We identify forms and refer to it by names. We give names to all that we know and recognize. We also give names to all that we can know and can recognize. Thus, we want to name the Ishwara, our personal God. We name people, we name objects, and we even name animals that we keep as pets. Thus, there is nothing unusual if we want to name the object of our veneration, the hallmark of perfection. It is not just figurative that we name, we also name the abstract. Have we not given names to our emotions? ‘Love’, ‘hate’, ‘anger’, ‘joy’ etc. are various names for our emotions. With the same spirit, we have given names to our faith. Brahma, Vishnu, Mahesh or Rama, Krishna, Hanuman are the various names that we have given to our faith.
Impersonal and Personal God

In trying to relate ourselves with the impersonal God, we create the personal God. Rama and Krishna are nothing but forms in the Space. Each of these Gods has a unique form that distinguishes one from the other. We know it is Rama, or Krishna, or Sita, or Shankar, or Hanuman by its unique form. Similarly, we know it is a temple, or a mosque, or a church when we see one.

These are all various endeavors to define Space as per our convenience. We build a house at a place which is part of the Space. We ‘divide’ the house into rooms, whereas fact of the matter is that we simply redefine the Space, which was already there and which still continues to be there. We now call the pre-existing Space as our bedroom, living room, bathroom or kitchen. The bedroom appears so because of the beds kept there; if we were to keep the sofas there, the same space would now be called living room. The house inclusive of the rooms occupies the pre-existing Space without adding or subtracting anything to or from it. If we were to deconstruct the house, the Space would still be there. The divisions and partitions are ‘virtual’, whereas in reality the Space remains unaffected. Not just the rooms, but the walls that appear to be dividing the house into rooms are continuum of the Space. Any matter, living or non-living is continuum of the Space. All such matters occupy Space and when removed bring back Space into focus. Anything that is perceptible is part of the Space, whereas the Space itself remains imperceptible. The fact stated by the scientists is similar to the truth experienced by our Rishis.

Space and Form

Being matters, these are all part of the Space. The mosque is known so because of its form, and so is the church or the temple. It is basically the Space that is called the temple because of its form. If that very structure is demolished and another structure akin to the mosque is
constructed over it, the same Space ceases to be a temple and becomes a mosque. We relate our religious faith with some or the other form. While some of us need a form to meditate on, others need a form to meditate in. If there is nothing wrong with the latter, there should be nothing wrong with the former. No religion exists without associating itself with form because that is what gives it a unique identity.

**Unique to Universal**

Desire to be unique creates differences among the equals. This is very much reflected in today’s world. The inequality we see around us is all because of our desire to be unique. We feel superior or inferior because of this very differentiation. All the tensions in the world are because of this very differentiation. Remarkably, Vedanta advocates oneness while believing in the unity of all. From the standpoint of Vedanta, there is but one life, one world, and one existence. Every one of us is ‘That’ – You are ‘That’ – “Tat TwamAsi” and so am I – “AhamBramhanAsmi”.

**The best illusion ever created**

Still, we need a God as an object of our adoration. While trying to explain the concept of Maya, Sri Adi Shankar has given a beautiful example. A man sees some rope in the dark and mistakes it for snake. Obviously, he would be frightened. But as soon as he realizes that it is merely a rope, his fear wanes. Fact of the matter is that while there is no snake, he superimposes it on the rope because of Maya. According to Sri Shankar ignorance gives rise to fear; and with knowledge fear wanes. Now if there was indeed a snake and we mistook it for a rope, how will we react? Certainly we will have no fear whatsoever. In case the snake happens to be poisonous, we may die of the snakebite, but we would never die of fear. Don’t
people die of fear than the poison? God is the most marvelous of all illusions that we have ever created. It gives us assurance from which we get courage and confidence. It gives us the guarantee that nothing will go wrong while ‘That’ is with us.

Cohesion of Thoughts

As we superimpose a snake on a rope, similarly we superimpose a personal God on the impersonal God. We superimpose Bramhan, the impersonal God on the Space that is all-pervasive and eternal. We then superimpose Ishwara, the personal God on the Bramhan. This gives us the liberty to form and name our own God. In other words, we attach certain attributes to the Space and call it Bramhan and then again we attach certain more attributes and call it Rama, or Krishna, or Shiva. Various religions and sects have taken this liberty, so can the individuals. Some see the Ishwara or the God as He, some as She, some conceive That with form, some without form. To quote Rig Veda, Ekam Sat ViprahBahudaVadanti⁸ (Truth is one, but wise call it by many names).

Although there may be many longitudinal lines passing through a country, yet there is only one accepted time-zone for a nation. So, if the entire globe is conceived as a nation, will not there be a single time-zone? All the differences in the society are virtual, be it caste, creed, religion or nation. The Vedanta looks at the whole World as a single home – VasudhaivKutumbakam, thus limiting differences.

Belief in the God is not ignorance, but is very humane. The fear is still there. It is the fear of the Humanitarian Law. All religious faiths of the world have put forward certain Commandments that we must follow so that the God remains with us, because we cannot afford to have the God on the other side. Interestingly, while some scriptures try to scare us with the concept of hell, narak or dozakh, the Vedanta does not do so. In fact it does not cast fear, but asks us to be fearless. It only calls for the highest ethical practice and expansion of
the Self to accommodate all.\textsuperscript{i} The beauty of the Vedanta is that it does not command, but suggests, and leaves us to take those suggestions or discard it as per our own understanding.

Notes

\begin{enumerate}
\item Tat TwamAsi (En. Thou art That) (Chandogyia Upanishad 6.8.7)
\item Na TatraCaksuRGacchati Na VagGacchati Na Manah Na Vimo Na VijnimoYathaitadAnusisyat (Kena Upanishad; 1.3)
\item SrotrasyaSrotramManaso Mano Yat Vaco Ha VacamSa U PranasyaPranah CaksusasCaksuRAtimucyaDhirah PretyasmaiLokadAmrtaBhavanti. (Kena Upanishad; 1.2)
\item Na TvEvahamJatuNasam Na TvamNemeJanadhipah Na Caiva Na Bhavisyamah SarveVayamAtahParam (Bhagavad Gita; 2.12)
\item VasamsiJirnaniYathaVihaya NavaniGrhnatiNaroAparani TathaSariraniVihayaJirnany AnyaniSamyatiNavaniDehi (Bhagavad Gita; 2.22)
\item Complete Works of Swami Vivekananda; Volume V; Seventh Edition; Page 272
\item Brhadaranyaka Upanishad 1.4.10
\item Rig Veda 1.164.46
\item Om Ishavasyamidamsarvamayatkimchjagatyamjagat ten tyaktenbunjithamaagridhhahkasyaswiddhanam (Isopnishad 1.0) (En. Whatever is contained in this world, it all belongs to the Lord of this house. We can derive pleasure by renunciation and not possession. Should we then covet what does not belong to us? Thus let us not desire for other’s wealth.)
\end{enumerate}

Biography
Ranjan Kumar Singh is an author-film maker with more than thirty years of experience in print and audio-visual media with specialization in the field of art and culture. He has travelled far and wide to give lectures on various aspects of Indian Art and Culture. He has six published books to his credit and has contributed to several anthologies and periodicals. Currently he is on the Media Advisory Committee of the Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India; Internship Committee of the LokSabha(Lower House of the Parliament), Advisory Committee of the Indian Council for Cultural Relation’s Regional Office in Patna (Bihar) and also on the Governing Council of the Maithili-Bhojpuri Academy, Delhi.

Rethinking Fraternity in Pakistani Muslim society through an analysis of cross gender address words.
Abstract

The research explores the influence of Islam on the patterns of inter-gender communication in Pakistani society. It focuses on the address words, men and women employ while interacting with the strangers of opposite gender, younger in age, of their age and older. The research is based on the data obtained from 200 respondents: 100 male and 100 female, between the ages of 20 to 60 years. The study finds that the respondents prefer to use the words, standing for very close and intimate family relations like child, baby, daughter and son for younger in age, brother and sister for peer group and aunty, uncle or sir, madam for older in age. The reasons for using those address words are: to add a respectable air to the interaction with strangers, to feel confidence and to lessen shyness, to show tenderness, and to demonstrate conformity to the social set up with a few exceptions of young respondents who preferred formal, western style of communication. The study finds out that the cultural concept of respect in Pakistani society finds its roots in the Islamic idea of fraternity. This practice is prevalent in the Muslim cultures in other societies too.

Introduction
In the daily social interactions, we often times come across the situations; we don’t have any knowledge about the person we need to interact with. In Pakistan, however, there are different socially recommended patterns of social interaction determined by the socio-economic status, gender, and age of the participants, involved in any interaction. In Pakistan, it is recommended to behave in polite and respectable tone to the addressee/addresser of the opposite gender especially females. Gender segregation is a part and parcel of culture and religion of Pakistani society. Women, out of close family terms or blood relation are a bit difficult to access and they too avoid interacting with stranger men without any strong reason. However, the social, economic and academic motives always keep both the genders socially active and interactive, though they have to follow strictly the cultural norms and values in order to keep the interactions comfortable and safe. Use of words, socially not recommended may cause misunderstanding and be potentially face damaging and serve as face threatening act (Brown and Levinson, 1978: 74-5).

Researches regarding inter-gender interaction patterns in different societies need to be studied extensively as they would lead to the collection and analysis of address words/social tag across cultures and may serve to prevent cross-cultural misunderstandings. There is a great need for careful empirical studies of the communicative behaviour of natives of Urdu, the national language of Pakistan. Such studies are, unfortunately, very scarce yet can be very significant and interesting since they involve the phenomenon based on the Islamic concept of brotherhood and in particular Islamic socio-cultural concept of communication taking society as one family as a courtesy gesture. The present study is valuable, in part, because it was conducted to explore the address patterns at inter gender communication and the results will contribute to develop a repository of address words in Pakistan and understanding of the
sociolinguistic trends involved in inter gender communication in two different age groups/generations.

The study investigates the use of address words by both genders in Pakistan as there is need to study them with a purpose to explore and understand the intention of using these address words. The Pakistani communication pattern is different from many of the societies in the world so the study of intention behind these address words during cross gender interactions, besides the cultural context is significant. It will help understand the social structure, values, and norms of Pakistani society. In studying the address words, we learn the socially approved and recommended ways of communication. It is an exploration of the native speakers’ internalized approach towards different address words and their use in different situations and with different addressees. The study of the use of different address words is significant as they are manifestation of social norms and indicate variety of opinions, approval, or experience of the individuals in the society. They not only reveal the social tradition but in fact strengthen and maintain the culturally approved behaviours also. The system of address words in a language is not prescribed, since it is open to empirical investigation.

The objective of this study is to investigate the use of address words between both the genders for each other in different age groups in Pakistan. The following questions have been developed to achieve this objective:

1. What are the address words, they use while interacting with the strangers of opposite gender; younger in age, of their age and older in age?
2. What are the differences in the use of different address words between the genders and in different age groups in the same gender
3. What are the reasons of using those specific address words?
Islamic concept of brotherhood

In Islam, there are two primary sources of guidance and instruction: the Holy Qur’an and Hadith i.e. the verbal instructions given by the Holy Prophet (PBUH), and his practices in daily life since his speech and actions were under the direct command of Almighty. Allah Almighty has declared in the Holy Qur’an, all the human beings are descendants of one couple, hence brothers and sisters. ‘O mankind! Lo! We have created you from male and female, and have made your nations and tribes that you may know one another.’ (Al Qur’an, 49:13). Thus the Muslim society is based on the idea of fraternity and all the Muslims are required to be helpful and supportive to the fellow beings.

Muslims follow the life of the Holy Prophet to gain Allah’s favor and to please Him. The Holy Prophet never exhibited any discrimination towards any individual or group of people on the basis of ideology, gender, age or socio-economic group in his whole life. Usama (RA) relates that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) passed by a company of people which comprised Muslims, idol worshipers polytheists, and Jews and he greeted them with the salutation of peace (Al-Nawawi, 1992: 245). He said: ‘Allah is gentle and loves gentleness in all things’(Al-Nawawi, 1992: 190). Islam gives supreme importance to the maintenance of peace and love in the society and promises rewards for even small gestures of kindness. Holy Prophet said: ‘Never disdain doing the least good, even greeting your brother with a cheerful face’(Al-Nawawi, 1992: 249).

The Holy Qur’an talks extensively about the social life and rights of women and the Holy Prophet practically had been very kind with the women. AsmabintYazid (RA) relates: The Holy Prophet (PBUH) passed by us, a party of women and greeted us’(Al-Nawawi, 1992: 245). The Holy Qur’an talks about the men and the women side by side, Allah
Almighty has declared all the believers to be the shield for one another. ‘And the believers, men and women, are protecting friends one of another… ’ (Al Qur’an, 9:71).

In Islam, it is not advisable to call the strangers with any of the address words that create the feeling of estrangement “If someone wants to call to a person, whom he does not know, then it is best to use general terms which will not annoy him, such as friend, brother” (Afridi and Syed, 2010: 2). Islam does not ignore the aspect of age in social interaction, “When you talk to someone, give due regard to his age, status and his relationship to you” (Afridi and Syed, 2010: 173). “It is part of glorification of Allah to respect an aged Muslim” (Afridi and Syed, 2010: 334). “If a youth respects a person on account of his old age, Allah appoints someone who will respect him in his old age” (Afridi and Syed, 2010: 334).

Islam does not pose restriction on inter gender communication; however, it is not in the favor of free mixing of genders without any reason as it may disturb the discipline in society. There are certain guidelines for women about how to speak, when they interact with stranger men. “When women happen to talk with men, they should speak in a clear, straight and rough (very formal) manner. They ought not speak in delicate, sweet tone, lest the listener should entertain any foul expectations” (Afridi and Syed, 2010: 172).

Methodology

An open ended questionnaire comprising two parts was developed for collecting data for this study. The first part of the questionnaire required the respondents to provide the address words used by them for older, peer, and younger strangers of opposite gender. In the second part of the questionnaire the respondents were asked to provide reasons for having specific choice of address words for different age groups of opposite gender. 200 questionnaires: 100 by male respondents and 100 by female respondents of different age
groups, who were mostly from the middle strata of society, were got filled for this study by the authors. The respondents were divided mainly into two groups: 50 respondents of each gender were 20-40 years of age, and the rest of the 50 respondents of either gender were from 40 to 60 years of age. This grouping of respondents was based on the social concept of youth and age in Pakistani society. Male and female respondents of 20-40 years of age would be considered young in the context of Pakistani society while someone who exceeds 40 is overgrown to be considered young. So the people of 40-60 years of age regardless of gender are considered old. The respondents were asked to give as many address words as they use in their everyday interactions with the younger, of the same age, and older strangers of opposite genders. The address words thus obtained and the reasons of using them were then analyzed for their forms, attributes praised, gender, and status relationships.

Results

Following are the results and detailed analysis of the data collected from 200 respondents regarding the use of address words and the reasons for using them. The address words reported by the male and female respondents have been shown in the following bar diagrams.
Male Respondents

Chart 1: Frequency of different address words employed by the male respondents while interacting with female addresses.
Chart 2: Reasons for making use of different address words for female addressees, given by the male respondents

**Female Respondents**

![Chart 2: Reasons for making use of different address words for female addressees](image)

Chart 3: Frequency of different address words employed by female respondents while interacting with male addresses

![Chart 3: Frequency of different address words employed by female respondents](image)
Chart 4: Reasons given by the female respondents for the use of different address words while interacting with males.

Discussion

In Pakistan, the people between the age of twenty to forty years are normally considered young. As by the age of twenty years, they are able to develop a strong and mature idea of their own identity as male or female members of society; and their approach towards people of different age groups. The address words reported for the younger female strangers by the young male respondents were several and most of them were for quite young girls, since they immediately imagined only very young girls as younger to them. The data shows most of the youth of either gender did not use the word son or daughter for young kids. It reflects the Pakistani culture in which young people do not generally call young kids daughter or son before they are married/become practically parents or are working in some practical field where there is a trend of calling the younger people beta (son/daughter). This is the same word, as is used for one’s real children too.

It was found that only two percent of the young (20-40 years old) respondents reported that they would address a young girl as beti- daughter while eight percent of the respondents said they would use the word beta (son) for young girls too. Semantically, beta is a specific word for male child but socially it is used in a way that it has gained the status of a gender neutral term, so it is equally used for the young girls and boys. Interestingly the word beti is used for girls only and never for the male child. It is thought to be derogatory to associate female attributes or address words with males; however, it is generally commendable to associate the male attributes with females. The elder male respondents (of
40 to 60 years of age) reported to use the words son/daughter in almost eighty percent of their interaction with the younger females. Among them only ten percent used the word beti (daughter) while the remaining seventy-six percent of them opt for the word beta (son) since it’s thought to be more appropriate to use a gender neutral expression. Almost all of them were already performing the parental role and people prefer to call their real daughters also beta (son) as it gives more confidence to the addressee as compared to word beti (daughter) which might be an indication of stigmatization or marginalization as female.

Twenty-four percent of the young and forty-four percent of the elderly male respondents reported three ways of adopting different address words which mean sister for the female strangers of their age group. Almost half of the young and one third of the older male respondents who opt to call them sister, literally used the word "sister" which has far more formal and superficial effects, being an English word. The words for sister in Urdu are behnand behna. Behna is somehow informal and carries some higher effects of affection and closeness as compared to behn which is rather formal. All the male respondents reported that they chose to call a desi (local) looking girl behin and prefer to call the modern ones as sister. The addressee’s status too is important since the modern educated youth prefer to use English word regardless of apparent educational or social status of the addressee; however it varies from individual to individual.

The young male respondents showed a marked tendency for different formal English address words like hello/excuse me/hi/hey i.e. thirty-two percent. It is at times very much difficult for the youth to dare to address a female of their age since socially it is not much approved. As the young girls are in the age when they are considered vulnerable to get infatuated or the young men may try to trap them so their intention are mostly discouraged and taken as suspicious. The modern educated Pakistani youth like to adopt the western
culture and try to remain out of any kinship feeling. They reported the traditional protocols as orthodox and outdated. The use of these western words in the older group of male respondents, however, is zero percent. So miss, excuse me, please, listen, hey are the formal ways of address among youth only. As the youth is getting conscious about not getting informal and the effects of western culture and universities' culture too push them to make use of these words. 'If I address a female by calling her sister, someone can offend me by saying miss so and so is your sister, despite I had used this word just to overcome our discomfort', as reported by one of the young respondents. In order to avoid such situations, they prefer to use the formal western address words and avoid calling a female addressee 'sister'.

Words like behn, baji, api, apa are the Urdu equivalents of sister especially for an elder sister. The frequency of these words in the older group of male respondents was up to hundred percent while among the younger group, it was used as much as they used for the peer group female strangers i.e. twenty four percent. All these words mean sister and people use them to call their real sisters as well. As it is impolite to call the elder siblings, cousins, neighbors or any acquaintance by their names. An addition of gee adds a higher degree of respect in informal relations and higher degree of formality in formal setting. Some of the older respondents reported to adds gee to these words to verify the upper status of addressee. As they think that the upper class women might get offended if a man lower in socio economic status tries to call them aunty or uses any synonym of it in local languages. Hence it is not unusual to call a lady of higher status baji (sister) or baji gee (respected sister) when she is of the age of mother or grandmother of a male addresser of lower social status.

For the older females, ninety-two percent of the young male respondents chose to useMiss/madam/ma’am with sometimes an addition of 'excuse me', mainly because of their
being in the habit of using the English address words or because the addressee enjoys a higher socio economic status. The major reason for choosing these address words was to sound formal, to form good impression, and to avoid offending the addressee by escaping the idea that they are trying to get informal. Official decorum was reported as another major reason. Among the older group male respondents, the frequency of these words was up to just an eight percent. Mainly because they considered themselves to be in a safe age zone where they had minimum chances to be taken as disrespectful. Secondly, they were more traditional than the youth.

All the respondents found it comparatively easy to communicate with the elders of either gender in Pakistani society with different address words used for the kinfolks. Forty-eight percent of the young male respondents chose to call the women of their mother’s age as aunty. This is another evidence of the effects of western culture on Pakistani youth. Among the older group the use of this word is not higher than two percent, since they are not affected by the western culture as much as the younger group is.

Besides aunty, thirty-six percent of the youth call elderly ladies maternal aunt. The Urdu equivalent Khala is used for maternal aunt which was found to be the second favorite word for the young respondents to address a stranger of their mother’s age. The frequency of this address word in the older respondents was twenty-eight percent only. It might be because of their age, since many among them were more than 55 years old so maybe they do not find it nice to call the older women as Khala (maternal aunt) as they are not much older than them. This might be the reason of the most frequent use of word ‘sister’ up to hundred percent in the older group.
Twenty-four percent of the young and sixty percent of the older male respondents used the words which mean mother for older ladies. These words are *maan gee/ amaan gee* which are practically used to address mother or grandmother. The older male respondents preferred to use these address words instead of aunty and *Khala*. They widely reported reason was to feel closer to the older ladies and to invoke their affection towards themselves.

The frequency of the use of word *Bibi (Ms)* is twenty-three percent among the older male respondents. The respondents who made use of this word were professionals like doctors, bankers, and policemen. They reported to use this word to address women of any age, lower in socio economic or academic status. For the women of higher status, they prefer to use English address words like madam and miss. Another way of using this word *bibi* was, by adding the suffix *gee*. *Bibi gee* is the word full of respect. Interestingly it changes the situation upside down. It was used by the men of working class or less educated men for the women of higher classes or highly qualification. In general, the male servants call the women of master family as *bibi gee* regardless of their age.

In the patriarchal society of Pakistan, women primarily enjoy the status of second rate citizens. It is a matter of general observation that in many institutions, the female officials of the same rank are discriminated due to gender bias. At domestic level too, women are mostly kept under strict control by the male members of family. However, at the social level the women are shown respect and are treated in a way which may make them comfortable and make their mobility convenient. The maximum number of male respondents i.e. ninety-four percent of young and seventy-nine percent of the older ones reported that they used such address words as to exhibit respect for the women. It does not necessarily mean that they actually respect these women, it is a cultural practice and they conform to it. The high score of responses of the younger group shows that they are more conscious in showing
respect towards women because the older group members are already in an age group where they are respected due to age and there are very scarce chances of misunderstanding.

More than half of the younger male respondents (sixty percent) use the kinship address words only because there are no other approved social way of interaction with strangers of the opposite gender. Here again we see that the older respondents (fifty-four per cent) have taken it as a cultural practice and may be for them it is a bit natural to use these words, though the younger men are thoughtful about it and might not have chosen using them in case there was any other socially acceptable way of addressing strangers of opposite gender. However, thirty percent of the younger men too, take it as a cultural obligation to make use of these addresses words.

Showing affection to the younger was found to be another major reason reported by young and elderly male respondents in an almost equal percentage. The existence of social pressure might not lead to the feeling of real affection for women though. Many of the respondents considered it a gesture of courtesy while for others the display of affection for younger was a way to get social approval and to show how mannered they were. Twenty percent of the respondents explicitly said that they do this as a part of impression building, to establish a comfortable situation and to be regarded as a polite and modest person.

Using specific words as a matter of habit mean that they do not mean, what they say. Twenty-seven percent among the older group and eighteen percent in the younger group of male respondents said that they just imitated others as it is had been social practice and they have developed the habit to use these address words in their daily interaction with the women. Twenty-two percent of the older and eighteen percent of the younger respondents reported that the use of kinship terms helped them get out of hesitation in a gender segregated system.
where it was really hard to access the strangers of other gender especially women. It makes the interaction and communication comfortable and gives them confidence to carry on the communication by building a feeling of kinship. It helps them form a nice impression on the female addresses who is likely to give them approval for a discussion.

The responses by the female respondents show that for the younger males, they frequently used the words which carry affection and stand for the parent-child relationship. Forty percent of the young female respondents and ninety-sixty percent of the elderly female respondents reported that they used the term Beta (son) for younger male addressees. Beta is used for one’s real children as well. Fifty-six percent of the young female respondents and hundred percent of the elderly female respondents reported to use word bhai (brothr) for the male strangers of their age group or somewhat younger or older. This was the most frequently reported word in the responses of female participants which they used in formal and informal social interactions especially with strangers of lower or equal socio economic status.

Kaka, bhanjay, chotay, chan are the words of affection for younger males and were used by sixty-four percent of the young and forty percent of the older female respondents. Chotey is employed for younger brother and it carries affection and an informal affect. Oye is an informal word, and a bit rude way to address a younger male. Bhanjay which means nephew (sister’s son) has an intimate, affectionate effect.

For the men, older in age, forty-eight percent of the young and twenty percent of older female respondents used the word Uncle. The choice of this words was determined by the addressee’s social and academic status, consciousness to show that the addresser was civilised and conscious of the addressee’s status. The addressee with a higher status was chosen to be addressed as uncle, however, a man of lower socio economic group was
reported to be mostly addressed by Chacha (paternal uncle) even by the educated and the upper class female respondents. Thirty-six percent of the young female respondents and fifty-two percent of the older respondents used the word Chacha. The word, uncle or chacha is generally chosen to be used when the addressee is sufficiently old in age more or less of one’s father’s age. It is interesting that in Pakistan, women pose to be of less age to their real age and sometimes they choose to call a man chacha/uncle who could be hardly as old as their own elder siblings would be.

The use of foreign words like hello/excuse me/ hi/mr. for the male addressees, was common among twenty-four percent of the young female respondents. However, just one percent of the older female respondents opt to use them. The younger female respondents were conscious about keeping the interaction in limits and building their bold image under the influence of the western culture. The choice of these words was reported to be determined by the spatio-temporal aspect of communication. Most of the time, these words were used in formal setting, or when the addressee had a higher status, or when the addresser was conscious of her impression formation and wanted to avoid using any word of affection or kinship. The consciousness to maintain distance with the males of the same age was reported to be remarkably high in the young female respondents. It is not much approved socially to get mixed with males of one’s age as it may lead to any intimate terms, which is against the cultural norms of the Pakistani society. Sir, too is a very formal and neutral word and is frequently used in the official and formal settings for both the same age group and older men. The frequency of its use among the youth is fifty-six percent for the peers and sixty-four for the older men. Among the older group of respondents, it is twenty-four percent for peers and twenty-eight percent for the older/senior males.
The reasons for using the above discussed address words, given by the female respondents were almost similar to those given by the male respondents with a fluctuation of frequency. Among females the element of culture got the highest score as a reason of using these address words. Fifty-six percent of the older and thirty-six percent of the young female respondents used these words because this was the only culturally approved way of interaction with men. One of them wrote a note in the reasons that she wouldn’t use these address words used for kinfolk when she was abroad. Fifty-four percent of the young and twenty-two percent of the older women reported the use of these words to show respect for strangers of opposite gender. Some of them reported that they used such address words to get respect and attention from the addressees. As one of the respondents said: 'If you are rude, they (male addressees) may not behave respectfully or may not pay any attention to you. Getting respect or response immediately helps you complete the communication well in time and you need not be in an uneasy atmosphere for a longer time'.

Another thirty-six percent of younger and twenty-seven percent of the older female respondents used these words because they felt secure during the interaction with stranger men which otherwise might cause discomfort if the feeling of estrangement were dominant. So they had a feeling that their intentions to interact with men were not misunderstood. A young woman reported: "The women think that if men are addressed as kinsfolk or quite formally, they do not try to or think of taking liberties". On the contrary, thirty-six percent of the young and twenty-eight per cent of the older women used these words to feel comfortable by giving an informal touch to the interaction.

Twenty-eight percent of older and twenty percent of the young women used these words as a matter of habit which they developed by imitating other women. Otherwise they did not find any logical and convincing reason behind making use of these words. The reason reported for
using the formal foreign words was that the interactants wanted to avoid the use of culturally prevalent practice of addressing strangers with the words, used for one’s relations or to show affection because they do not want to generate hopes in the men to expect any favours from them. Some respondents, who were doctors, bankers, teachers and field managers of cellular companies by profession, reported that they themselves were in early and late twenties and they could not afford to raise any feeling of kinship in men who in turn might try to exploit the situation to get positive or special treatment.

Conclusion

The study showed that the Pakistani men and women between twenty to sixty years of age, frequently make use of the words employed for blood relations, to address the strangers of opposite gender according to the age of the addressee with reference to their own age. The study was based on the data collected from two hundred respondents: hundred men and hundred women who were further divided into two groups of fifty respondents each. i.e. twenty to forty and forty to sixty years of age. The data was collected through an open ended questionnaire which had two sections: the first section required the respondents to enlist the address words, they used for the younger, peer and older addressees of the opposite gender. The second part of the questionnaire required them to state the reasons for using those address words.

The ninety-six of the older female respondents reported to use the gender equivalents for daughter and sister (son and brother) exactly as much as the men of older group used these words. The use of words sister and brother was hundred percent prevalent in the older respondents of both genders. However, the use of these address words among the members of younger groups of both the genders was different. The young women used the words son and
brother almost twenty percent more frequently than men of the same age group using words like daughter and sister. This shows that Pakistani women tend to be more affectionate even at the young age as compared to the men.

The use of local words Khala and Chacha for aunt and uncle respectively was almost equally widespread among the youth of either gender. The older respondents, however, had different patterns since fifty-two percent of the women used the word Chacha as compared to twenty eight percent of the older men who used the word Khala. It may be because sixty percent of older men reported the use words maange/amaan gee (mother) for the elderly women to show higher degree of respect and affection. The women, however, can never use any word, used for father for the strangers.

Interestingly the women used bhanjay for young children which means son of sister not the son of brother and we saw that the men used the word Khala which stands for maternal aunt. The word bhatieja (brother’s son) and phupi (paternal aunt) were not reported to be used by any respondent. Similarly the female respondents used the word Chacha (father’s brother) for the men of their father’s age, the word Mamoon (mother’s brother) was used by none of them as it is culturally pejorative.

The use of foreign words for relations like aunty and uncle has the same pattern of use among the members of younger groups of both the genders i.e. forty eight percent. However there is a sharp contrast among the members of older groups of either gender i.e. two percent among the men and twenty percent among the women. It shows that the women are more conscious about impression formation and giving a sophisticated touch to the interaction. Women also preferred to use this word as a neutral word since it is used for maternal, paternal and distant relatives of one’s parents and for strangers equally. The younger male respondents
predominantly used the word hello as compared to their reciprocal female respondents. The difference in frequency is because the men have to be more careful while interacting with the strangers of the other gender as their intentions could be suspected very easily hence they prefer to be formal.

Interestingly, the young respondents of either gender were more conscious of showing respect and the older respondents of either gender were more conscious about cultural conformity. For affection, the percentages show that males tended to be more affectionate towards females. Besides affection, twenty percent men of young and older male respondents were found conscious to behave politely as it was thought to be the right of women to be treated tenderly. The men were also found to be more conscious about the formation of a good impression. They used politeness and affection towards women to form a good impression in society in general and particularly among women.

The young female respondents appeared to be the most insecure of all the other respondents. Around thirty-six percent of the young women reported to use these address words to make the interaction legitimate, among the older women this ratio reduces to twenty eight percent as the older women are less prone to be harassed or misunderstood. Socially it is an uneasy situation for both gender but women were more conscious than men to feel easy and secure in inter-gender communication. Moreover, a social pressures was noticed on both genders to imitate these words since there is no other socially approved way of inter gender interaction. It shows if they had any other choice, they would not have been using these address words. This might be the reason, that they have started using foreign address words to give the interaction a modern touch.
This study focused on exploring the address words used in inter gender interactions and the interpretation of these address words by the users. There is scope of studying the intra communication patterns and the intergender communication patterns in different geographical areas and with in different socio economic classes. Although the basic ideology is the same everywhere i.e. the concept of fraternity given by Islam but there are scores of social interpretations of the practices which form the basis of a culture.

References


THE ROLE OF RELIGION FOR PEACE AND HARMONY IN THE WORLD

(A comparative study in the light of Buddhism & Islam)

Prof. Dr. Sanaullah Bhutto1 Dr. Arshad Munir2 and Muhammad Tufail Chandio3

1Department of Islamic studies, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan
2Department of Islamic Studies College of Agriculture, Dera Ghazi Khan, Punjab Pakistan
3Department of English, University of Sindh, Laar Campus, Badin, Pakistan

Keyword(s): Buddhism, Harmony, Islam, Peace, Religion

ABSTRACT

The research paper aims to analyze and determine the role and scope of religion for maintaining peace and harmony all across the world. We can state without exaggeration that Religion is a positive factor for it goes a long way to maintain peace and invoke harmony and integration for humanity. A brief glance at the religions of the world reveals that all religions of the world have their own rights and stand for the peace in the world. Buddhist moral and spiritual teachings to great extent stand for brotherhood and harmony throughout the world. Similarly, Islam recognizes the fact that each religious teacher has faith in his own mission and wants to establish peace for mankind. Both religions are a living organization of peace and harmony for humanity. Hence in the light of religions and their teachings, both are aim at for betterment of humanity as well as propagate the message of love, equality, brotherhood, justice and equity.
I. Introduction

The Relation of Religion and Human Being

The important point which attracts our attention during the study of evolutionary development of human being is the relationship between human beings and religion. The life at its lower level of existence like that of animals and plants remains devoid of the concept of God and worship or altogether submission to the Creator, but no longer does it transcend to its higher level of consciousness like human being, religion becomes inalienable part and need of man. The religious ideology and teachings also progressed and evolved with the passage of time vis-a-vis human cognitive evolution. Hence religion has played a pivotal role in uplifting human moral values, devising solutions regarding psychological complexities and psychic phenomenon, character-building and mutual understanding among different fibers of the society. Thus it testifies that religion had been an integrated and inseparable part of social development and cognitive evolution. The traces of religion are noticeable in all areas of human learning and development.

The discovery of archeological findings provide information which authenticates this assumption that religion has remained cardinal stimulus and source of inspiration and integration among the nations, emergence of civilizations and unity among groups and nations.

The study of the history of religion reveals an interesting point that intuitional inclination of man towards religion is as old as far the traces of his conscious existence are found: both go hand in hand. The ancient remains and history has dived deep to unfold the various mysteries related to life and bring forth an objective and scientifically logical answer to these questions, but the most important thing the history, archeology and anthropology has found is the deep sense of attachment of human with religion in all parts of the world through all eras and epochs of history, among all nations and civilization. In addition, if the contribution of religion regarding the development of civilization and culture is objectively analyzed, it becomes a well-established fact that religion has not only provided...
them profound footings to flourish but also has provided them with unique direction to reach their zenith.

**The origin of Disintegration and Disputes in the Society and the Reasons of Extremism**

Extremism, basically, is an understanding or conviction a person or a group develops with the view point that their faith, ideology, code of conduct, living standard or style are unique, true therefore are sacrosanct and unquestionable. All the social scientists have agreed to the point that the wave of extremism undermines the very foundation of the society only when the violence and exploitation of social and political rights, religio-lingual superiority and disparity, oppression, socio-political injustice, immoral practices, uncouth traditions or values take their roots in the society. In the famous book: “Introduction to Sociology” defines extremism: “When the social values and laws are changed or confined for the materialistic benefit and self-centered gains of an individual or a particular group instead of those of general population, it culminates in the social rift; collectivism and nation integrity deteriorate to lowest ebb; hence the unique values for collective good and betterment of humanity in large get replaced with trends and practices of vested interests and individual personal gains. Thus, some individual or group of people manifest a particular reaction by doing some odd actions or activities, which may pose potential threat or damages to the life or property of other people or group.[1]

In 1953, Raymond A. Dart presented the curst of his research in one of his essays “The Predatory Transition from Ape to Man”, he maintains:

“The blood-spattered, slaughter-gutted archives of human history from the earliest Egyptian and Sumerian records to the most recent atrocities of the Second World War accord with early universal cannibalism, with animal and human sacrificial practices of their substitutes in formalized religions and with the world-wide scalping, head-hunting, body-mutilating and necrophilic practices of mankind proclaiming this common bloodlust differentiator, this predaceous habit, this mark of Cain.
that separates man dietetically from his anthropoidal relatives and allies him rather with the deadliest of Carnivora.”[2]

Now the question arises, was man fundamentally inclined towards bloodshed and oppression? Is shedding blood innate part of human nature? Has the man evolved present day civilized values and peaceful entity having undergone the period of barbarism and oppression? Is the man not provided with a system which can control the involving factors leading towards such abnormalities and could refine the conduct of man?

I personally believe that it is religion, which has played pivotal role in bringing man out from the life of animal state and barbarism to this refined and civilized mode of peaceful existence. It is a well-established fact that various religions from ancient to present time have introduced humanity with moral injunctions, the code of conduct, mutual respect and harmonious co-existence which have turned this world into a peaceful place and the man has acquired the status of civilized and cultured species.

The objective study of human history reveals that religion has always endeavored to resist the speedy course of decadence of human values and ever increasing uncertainty and translate it into still higher moral values and standards of ethics. It had been possible that man himself would have annihilated his own existence as being obsessed with the notion of oppression, barbarism, brutality and forcibly-acquired possession, but the teachings of different religions sparked from all across the globe and enlightened the gloomy vistas of human mind and propagated the values of peace, fraternity, equality, sacrifice and sense of responsibility.

It is a well-established fact that the period of 1000 BC in general and 6th century AD in particular had been the golden age of religious evolution, for religion provided man with unique and substantial guiding principles during this period; the cultivated land of Philistine
echoed with teachings of Israel; whereas, India was enlightened with the teachings of three contemporary religions viz. Aryan religion which evolved out of Brahmanism and laid the foundation of Hinduism, Buddhism which inculcated valued teachings for the prosperity of humanity and Jainism, which also emphasized on the moral and ethical code of living and gave priority of peace, coexistence and prevalence. During about the same period in China, Confucius and Laozi also introduced man with moral and ethical code of conduct to philosophically transcend human existence to the level of peaceful integrity; moreover, Zoroaster of Iran also preached for the general welfare and common good of mankind and these teachings still prevail and pave way for making this world worth-living. Besides these major religions, almost various minor religions prevailed in all parts of the globe, which strove for peace and progress of mankind.

It is a well-established fact that all religious teachings condemned barbarism, oppression, brutality and exploitation of any sort and promoted peace, justice, brotherhood, equality and liberty. In the study in hand, I will comparatively analyze and evaluate the teachings of two great religions i.e. Islam and Buddhism.

II. Buddhism and Islam: The Religions of Peace (a comparative study)

Buddhism: Among the religious movements which primarily were carried out on the land of India to bring forth reforms in the ancient traditions of Hinduism, the most important movement was Buddhism which, with the passage of time, emerged as a separate religion and spread even out of India to the various countries of South Asia like Burma, Tibet, China, Thailand and other states because it produced eloquent orators and able preachers. When the revival of Brahmanism took place in India, it reduced the Buddhist into minority and eventually it rolled back from the land of its birth, India; it however flourished in other states of the South Asia, presently, almost 225 million followers of Buddhism are present all across the world.[3]
The history presents no example of the teaching of high moral values like what Buddha presented. His teachings focused on the ways and means to refine and control bodily desires, which culminate in avarice, jealousy, selfishness, anger and revenge, he rather reiterated the principles which could inject the sense of integrity, peace, justice, affection, brotherhood, sympathy, non-violence and equality, which are the chief constituents of Buddhism. It is praiseworthy to mention that marvelous teachings of Buddhism directed humanity to the right path in the times of oppression, cruelty, selfishness and injustice.

Islam: The literary meanings of the word Islam is “to submit or to conciliate” whereas the idiomatic meaning connotes that Islam is the religion of peace, it means the teachings of Islam reiterate that man should submit to the laws of Allah, the Creator, the Nourisher and the Sustainer of the entire universe. The laws and code of conduct of life revealed by Almighty Allah and taught by His prophets spread love, peace, justice, brotherhood, equality and tolerance. In Arabic language, the word “Islam” etymologically means peace, security, safety and equity. Islam as a religion was not only preached and propagated by Hazarat Muhammad (peace be upon him) but all the prophets sent by Almighty Allah did preach and practice the religion of Islam.

“In accordance with the tenets and teaching of Islam, human life has two main reasons and objectives to exist and prevail: individually man should be provided with all essential requisites and laws to live a peaceful and respectable life, collectively essential measures should be taken to invest all human energy, power, wisdom for general good, collective welfare and over all progress and development of the society at global level, so that the march of civilization may proceed to the state of more perfection and better world; moreover, the balance between the individual and society vis-a-vis integration and interrelatedness between the single component and collective body may also be maintained and adjusted to carry on the future course of things. The sort of check and balance propounded by Islam does not allow individual to fringe the rights of society and vice versa”. [4]
It is Islam which laid the foundation of universal brotherhood, and condemned all sorts of
discrimination based on caste, creed, colour, riches and possession. The Holy Quran, the last and final
revelation of Allah to the last prophet, Hazarat Muhammad (p.b.u.h), categorically reveals:

―O mankind! We created you from a single (pair) of a male and female and made you into nations
and tribes, that ye may know each other (Not that ye may despise each other). Verily the most
honoured of you in the sight of God is (he who) is the most righteous of you – and God has full
knowledge and is well acquainted (with all things).‖ [5]

Besides, the last prophet of Allah, Hazarat Muhammad (p.b.u.h) also inculcated and reiterated the
same message to humanity:

―O people! Verily your Lord is One and your father is one. All of you belong to the ancestry of Adam
and Adam was created from clay. An Arab is not superior to a non-Arab neither is a non-Arab
superior to an Arab. Similarly the white has no superiority over the black nor does the black have
superiority over the white: except in piety. Verily the noblest among you is the most pious.” [6]

Thus, Islam has provided complete code of conduct for human life and has along with well-expressed
tenets of faith, ways and means of worship so that by acting upon the injunctions of Islam man may
live a peaceful and respectable life.

**Buddhism and Islam: The Religions of Peace**

In order to have a peaceful society, it is incumbent to provide safety to the life and property of the
member of that society. In addition to it, an individual should also regard and practice the
fundamental laws and codes pertaining to ethics and morality and abstain from evil deeds like theft,
robbery, cheating, gambling, addiction and injustice; besides, they may avoid all sorts of indulgence
which affect and mar rational faculties. They must live with peace and equality, practice justice and
tolerance; respect the rights of one another.
In the light of above perspectives, this research study delves deep to critically analyze and evaluate the teachings of Islam and Buddhism. The paper only focuses the ten commandments of Buddhism for attaining Nirvana (the pure and elevated state of soul) and will analytically dissect them in connection with the injunctions of Islam for the pursuit of purity and elevation of human soul to attain higher self for the general welfare and good of humanity and making this world peaceful and worth-living.

Buddha believes that if any individual intends to abstain from all kinds of sins and wishes to live with piety and prudence must adopt seclusion, practice ascetic life style and exercise simplicity in wearing, eating and drinking. Besides, he needs to avoid profligacy, ostentation, affectation and vanities. The person who abides by these teachings of Buddha by letter and spirit is called Bikhsu. When one becomes Bikhsu, he acts upon these commandments of Buddha to attain Nirvana.

He will not kill any living organism

He will not commit theft

He will not commit adultery

He will not speak lie

He will not get used to any kind of addiction

He will not have food after afternoon

He will keep himself away from the music and dance parties

He will not practice affectation or ostentation and will not use perfumes

He will not sit on any comfortable seat, chair or bed

He will keep himself away from gold and silver
It is a well-established fact that the peace in the world gets disturbed when an individual or a group or part of the society faces danger and violence inflicted upon them by others. The most important thing for man is life itself; if life is in the state of jeopardy, it leads to intensive violence and destruction of world at large. For that, all the religions of the world give much importance to life.

1. Laws and Injunctions of Islam about human life

The laws, on which foundation of Islamic society and civilization is based on, the foremost among these laws is the law of life and its security. Piety of human soul and positivity, truthfulness and altruism in human action are the most praiseworthy tenets of Islam, whose parallel can ever be found in any religion of the world.

The Holy Quran has mentioned the first act of crime and violence, in which a man killed another, and regards it as the first evil action of human history which paved way for the ultimate disintegration, decay and downfall of mankind. Hence, it became indispensable to teach man to respect and take care of the life of other livings. It was to be inculcated that every living has a right to live, exist and prevail. After mentioning this heinous act of murder, the Holy Quran reveals that:

“On that account we ordained for the children of Israel that if any one slew a person unless it be for murder or for spreading mischief in the land it would be as if he slew the whole people and if any one saved a life it would be as if he saved the life of the whole people.” [9]

The above-cited verse reiterates that the murder of one person is tantamount to killing all human beings whereas saving the life of one person is likely to save the whole mankind. While mentioning the characteristics of virtuous man, Allah Almighty reveals in the Holy Quran that:

“Those who make not with God any other god, nor slay such life as God has made sacred” [10]

To highlight the importance of piety and abstinence from evil indulgence, it was further revealed that:

“Take not life which God hath made sacred except by way of justice and law” [11]
Hazrat Anas bin Malak quotes that the Holy Prophet Hazrat Muhammad (P.B.U.H) said that the four among all major sins were to associate any partner with Allah, to commit a murder, to disobey parents and to speak lie.[12]

The Holy Prophet in his last sermon delivered at the eve of Hajj said:

“I apprise you that your lives, your property and your honour are similarly as sacred to one another as this sacred day of this sacred month in this sacred town, soon you will be meeting your Lord and He will ask you about your actions. [13]

Islam promulgates stern laws and codes to punish those who spread mischief, commit murder and indulge in terrorism and bloodshed, invoke extremist practices in the society, for them there will be far severe punishment after the Day of Judgment.

If any Islamic state is circumstantially bound to wage war or it is imposed upon them, even then if a person from the enemy side begs for asylum, he must be provided with secure asylum and he should be escorted to the safe place he intends to go to.

“If anyone amongst the Pagans asks thee for asylum, grant it to him so that he may hear the word of God and then escort him to where he can be securing that is because they are men without knowledge.”[14]

Islam prefers and appreciates to set the war prisoner free and forbids inflicting torture and misery upon them. Besides, Islam strongly propounds that women, children, the aged, physically or mentally impaired and sick will not be harmed in the battlefield or at warfronts.

Whatever ethical and moral values the present day civilized world possess and boasts of, Islam has its due share in it because the teachings of Islam commenced in the epoch of decadence, disintegration, downfall of values and ethics to the extent that life itself lost its worth and was molested and destroyed with no remorse or regret.
2. Abstinence from Committing Theft

The second commandment of Buddha for becoming Bikhshu is about the safety of property. It is an undeniable fact that property and possession causes feuds and scuffle in the society, the situation further aggravates if the property or possession is achieved or accumulated by unfair and illegal means. One among many other illegal means of taking possession of other’s property is theft, which ensues uncertainty, disintegration, conflict and quarrels in the society.

Islamic Laws and Injunction about Property

Islam clearly bifurcates the fair and unfair means of accomplishing or accumulating property, it emphasizes the fair and judicious ways to obtain it whereas strongly admonishes and condemns for applying unfair or illegal means to achieve the property what does not legally belong to or you are not legally entitled to possess it. The Holy Quran reveals:

“O ye who believe! Eat not up your property among yourselves in vanities: but let there be amongst you traffic and trade by mutual good will. [15]

It further reveals:

“And do not eat up your property among yourselves for vanities, nor use it as bait for judges with intent that ye may eat up wrongfully and knowingly a little of (other) peoples’ property.[16]

To commit theft is included one of the major sins and Islam has legislated punishment for it: the Holy Quran prescribes:

“As to the thief male or female, cut off his or her hand: A punishment by way of example from God, for their crime and God is Exalted in power.[17]

If the members of a society get involved in unfair and unjust means of accumulating property like injustice, adulteration, bribe, interest, cheating, baiting, gambling; as the result, the whole fiber of the society gets tinted with evils, quarrels and bloodshed, hence the society becomes bound to wither and
crumbles into irrecoverable downfall. Islam not only strongly forbids getting involved in unjust means of collecting property but it also legislates and promulgates clear laws and injunctions regarding the punishments of such heinous acts.

3. To avoid Adultery

The third commandment of Buddha is not to indulge in adultery. As adultery or extramarital sex spreads decadence, disputes and downfall of values in the society, so Islam has also forbidden illegitimate ways and means employed for the fulfillment of carnal desires. Adultery is one of that illegitimate ways of fulfilling sensual desires therefore the Holy Quran ascertains it as one of the heinous sins/crimes. Almighty Allah reveals:

“Nor come nigh to adultery for it is a shameful (deed) and an evil, opening the road (to other evil).”[18]

The Holy Prophet pledged a promise from the believers:

Narrated Ubdah bin As-saamit: Allah’s Apostle said while a group of his companions were around him: Swear allegiance to me for: Not to join anything in worship along with Allah, not to steal, not to commit illegal sexual intercourse, not to kill your children, not accuse an innocent person (to spread such an accusation among people), not to be disobedient (when ordered) to do good deed. The prophet added: whoever amongst you fulfills his pledge will be rewarded by Allah. [19]

Islam owing the seamless consequences and adverse after-effects of adultery has ordained it an act subject to punishment. The Holy Quran prescribes the punishment for adultery as under:

“The woman and man guilty of adultery or fornication, flog each of them with a hundred stripes. Let not compassion move you in their case, in a matter prescribed by God, if ye believe in God and the Last Day and let a party of the believers witness their punishment.”[20]
The great Islamic scholar Maududi writes: “Islam does not rely on punitive law alone for saving humanity from the menace of fornication. It employs both reformatory and prohibitory measures on a large scale. It has provided legal punishment only as a last resort. Islam does not want that the people should go on committing this crime and getting flogged with stripes day and night. Its real aim is that the people should not commit this crime at all and there should be no occasion to resort to the extreme punishment. For this purpose Islam first of all purifies man. It imbues him with the fear of All-Powerful and All-Knowing Allah, it inculcates in him the sense of accountability for his actions in the Hereafter from which even death cannot release him. It fills him with obligation of obedience to Divine Law which is sure to follow true faith.”[21]

4. Fourth Commandment of Buddha about Prevention from Speaking False

It is a fact that lie is the mother of all social evils; it begets disputes, breach of trust and pollutes the peace, truth and justice. Truth has always royal road to peace and prosperity notwithstanding some jerks and jolts bound to impede its way. Buddha forbids from telling lie and commands to follow the path of truthfulness. Likewise, Islam also ordains its believers to abstain from speaking lie, and to practice truthfulness in life. The Holy Quran reveals:

“O ye who believe! Fear God and be with those who are true (in word and deed).[22]

The Holy Prophet said:

Narrated Abdullah: The Prophet (S.A.W.S) said: “Truthfulness leads to righteousness, and righteousness leads to paradise, and a man keeps on telling the truth until he becomes a truthful person. Falsehood leads to Al-Fajur (i.e. wickedness, evil doing) and Al Fajur (wickedness) leads to the (Hell) fire, and a man may keep on telling lies till he is written before Allah, a liar.” [23]

Narrated Abu Bakra: Allah’s Apostle inculcated thrice: “Shall I not inform you of the biggest of the great sins?” we said yes o Allah’s apostle. He said, “To join partners in worship with Allah, to be undutiful to one’s parents” the Prophet set up after he had been reclining and added, “And I warn you
against giving forged statement and a false witness, I warn you against giving forged statement and false witness.” The Prophet keeps on saying that warning till we thought that he would not stop. [24]

5. Abstinence from Addiction

To attain the state of Nirvana, Buddha in his fifth commandment emphasizes altogether abstinence from all sorts of addiction. It is a fact that the use of drugs and intoxicant material affects the faculties of human, the reasoning faculties for time being remains suspended therefore one fails to distinguish between vice and virtue, good and bad; as the result, it casts adverse impact upon the society and leads to ultimate downfall, decadence and unending disputes or quarrels.

Islam being the religion of peace and prudence also commands its believer to abstain from all kinds of addiction, not only this, but terms addiction as Haram (impermissible/ unlawful/ illegitimate and its use is likely to commit sin and subject to punishment) and there are clear-cut laws of punishment for the consumer of intoxicant materials and drugs of addiction. The Holy Quran reveals:

“O ye who believe, intoxicants, and gambling (Dedication to) stones and (divination by) arrows are an abomination of Satan’s handiwork. Eschew such (abomination) that ye may proper. Satan’s plan is (but) to excite enmity and hatred between you with intoxicants and gambling, and hinder you from the remembrance of God, and from prayer will you not then abstain. [25]

Though originally the Arabic word Khamar meant only wine made from grapes, and it was also applied to the liquors made from wheat, barley, dried grapes, dates and honey. The Holy Prophet (S.A.W.S) applied the prohibition to all the intoxicants, and there are traditions that clearly support this, for instance:

Narrated Aisha; Allah’s Apostle was asked about Al-Bit: he said that all drinks that intoxicate are unlawful (to drink). [26]
Narrated Ibn Umar: “Umar stood up on the pulpit and said: Now then prohibition of alcoholic drinks have been revealed and those drinks are prepared from five things i.e. grapes, dates, honey, wheat or barley and an alcoholic drinks is that disturbs the mind. [27]

In this connection the Holy Prophet laid down the general principle: if a large dose of something is intoxicant, then its smallest dose also is unlawful, and if a cup of everything is intoxicant then a drop of it also is unlawful. [28]

6. Abstinence from Food after Mid-Day

Buddha in is sixth commandment suggest his follower that for becoming true Bhikshu they must not eat after the mid of the day. For the midday is the crucial time for working, if one takes lunch, he feels sleepy, lethargic and drowsy; therefore, the speed, quality and quantity of doing work gets marred/hampered. Buddha wants his followers to keep themselves away from taking meal after mid of the day.

However, Islam on the contrary has not forbidden taking routine lunch, but there is a month in which all Muslim adults are supposed to observe fast and not to drink or eat anything from dawn to dusk, this observance is regarded as worship. The month is called Ramdhan – the month of bounty and benevolence. Allah Almighty reveals:

Ramadhan is the (month) in which was sent down, the Quran, as a guide to mankind, also clear (Signs) for guidance and judgment (between right and wrong) so everyone of you who is present (at his home) during that month should spend it in fasting, but if anyone is ill or own journey, the prescribed period (should be made up) by days later. God intends every facility for you, He does not want to put you difficulties. [29]

Further ALLAH says: And eat and drink until the white thread of dawn appears to you distinct from its black thread then complete your fast till the night appears.[30]
The observance of fast is highly beneficial for individual in particular and society in general. The fasting instills patience, tolerance, sympathy for hungry people and piety or control over baser passions.

7. Avoidance from Music, Dance and Party

In his seventh commandment, Buddha forbids to join dance parties, musical concert because such deeds eventually become an inalienable and integral part of the nature of rich people; the continuous indulgence in these activities makes them obsessed with sensual and amorous sentiments, ostentation, worldly affection, pomp and show. Thus, such sorts of parties of music and dance lead to moral decadence, as the result, the young debauchee become lethargic, work-shy, lecherous, debauched and prone to unending quarrels, feuds and disputes. Islam has also forbidden attending such kind of parties/concert which may lead towards ultimate decay and downfall of individual and society as well.

The Holy Prophet said that some of my followers would drink wine just by changing/labeling it with other names, music would be played before them, and there would be female singer/dancer before them. Allah would inhume them under the ground and their state would be degraded to the level of a beast. [31]

Islam does not altogether forbid attaining the parties/gatherings that provide aesthetic pleasure to human, neither does Islam suppress human natural feelings but it only draws laws and principles to control, refine and reform the conduct of man, so that he could have self-control, temperance and piety. Islam allows such kinds of gathering/get-together parties/concerts which may not result into amorous indulgence, disputes and feuds.

8. Avoiding Affectation/Ostentation and Perfumes

In his eighth commandment, Buddha forbids his Bikhsu to indulge in worldly ostentatious vanities of pomp and show and also prevents from using/applying/spraying perfume. Buddha is of the view that nobody can attain the state of Nirvana unless he has subdued and refined his passion/appetites and is
not slave to his desires. Basically, these things/activities imbue worldly and materialistic feelings in human being and hinder or impede one from going into the state of seclusion and complete asceticism.

Whereas, Islam strongly inculcates the importance of cleanliness and teaches its followers to keep themselves clean, tidy and in good state of hygiene; however, the teaching of Islam compulsorily requires believers to do ablution, take bath; in addition to it, Islam not only permits to use perfume but in some cases declares it a praise-worthy act to be applauded for it inspires others and brings positivity in the quality of life. Allah Almighty reveals: “O children of Adam wear your beautiful apparel at every time and place of prayer, eat and drink but waste not by excess, for God loveth not the wasters”. [32]

Holy Prophet himself liked perfume and he also suggested/taught his followers to apply/spray perfume (the soothing impact of fragrance increases the opportunity of interaction which leads to love, attachment and positive relationship. [33]

Narrated Salman-Al-Farsi: The prophet Muhammad (S.A.W.S) said whoever takes a bath on Friday, purifies himself as much as he can, then uses his (Hair) oil or perfumes himself with the scent of his house, then proceeds (For the Juma prayer) [an especial pray offered on each Friday] and does not separate two persons sitting together (in the mosque) then prays as much (ALLAH has) written for him and then remains silent while the Imam is delivering the Khutba [sermon], his sins in between the present and last Friday would be forgiven.[34]

If somebody offers presents containing perfume, it is obligatory on other to accept it. [35]

There is only one occasion, on which applying perfume is forbidden in Islam that is during the pilgrimage or Hajj. The dress which pilgrims wear during performing Hajj is called Ahram, and it is forbidden to spray perfume/attar on it.[36]
The latest research studies and in-depth exploration have opened fresh window to this kind of knowledge that fragrance casts deep impact/influence on the attitude of human beings; it not only enthruses man but also works as stimulus. In the 21st century Fragrance Therapy is used as a mode of treating patients.

9. Sitting and Sleeping on Comfortable beds/things

In order to attain the state of Bhikshu, Buddha in his ninth commandment mentions that his true believer/follower would never sit on a comfortable thing nor will recline/sleep on it. This practice imbues simplicity and detachment from worldly comforts. Once a man frees himself from the luxury and lust, he does not easily fall prey to greediness, cunningness, cheating, feuds and injustice.

Conversely, Islam does not forbid availing the means of comfort for enhancing the quality of life but it prevents from making such accumulation whole purpose of life, whereas, Islam promotes simplicity, austerity and thriftiness in life. Holy Prophet himself lived a very simple life, though he was the leader of his nation/followers, yet he never exhibited the fake show of power and possession what mostly the kings or emperors of the powerful empires often did. He wore simple clothes, ate simple food and preferred simplicity and frugality in the other affairs of life as well. Hazrat Ayesha narrated that the bed of the Holy Prophet was made of leather, and a mat made out of the leaves of palm lay spread onto it.[37]

When one of the wives of the Holy Prophet, HazartHifiza was asked about the bed of the Holy Prophet, she replied that it was made of simple wool and was coarse and hard. Holy Prophet slept on it by folding it into two. Once she folded it four times to make it more comfortable, but on the next morning the Holy Prophet enquired from her what kind of bed she had set for him. She replied the bed had been same but she had just folded it four-fold to make it comfortable. The Holy Prophet ordered her to bring it to its previous state, because the comfortable bed constrained him for rising to Tahjad Prayers (offered after mid night).[38]
The above cited statements authenticate that the Holy Prophet did not sleep/recline on soft or comfortable bed, as these enhance to intensity and duration of sleep, thus one fails to worship one’s Lord. Though the Holy Prophet was the quintessence of humanity and paragon of virtue, one cannot expect or associate such failure with him, but he set this example for his followers and rest of humanity to track the path of truth.

10. Avoidance from Wearing Jewelry made of Gold or Silver

The tenth and last commandment of Buddha for Nirvana is that a Bhikshu would refrain from wearing/using gold and silver ornaments. It is also a source of detachment from materialistic world. It has been generally observed that greed and avarice of possessing silver and gold ensue quarrels and disputes in the society. Likewise, Islam also forbids use of the crockery/vessels made of gold, especially one used for dining purpose. The SahihBukhari includes one tradition:

Narrated Hudhaifa: The Prophet (S.A.W.S) forbade us to drink out of gold and silver vessels or eat in it and also forbade the wearing of silk.[39]

However, Islam allows women to wear the ornaments made of gold and silver but man is forbidden to wear ornaments made of such metals.

The Holy Prophet said that these both metals (their use for the sake of ornaments) are unlawful for male believers/followers; whereas, woman can use (silver and gold) for the sake of ornaments or jewelry.[40]

In the light of above tradition all Islamic jurists unanimously agree that:

The use of gold and silver for sake of beautification is unlawful for male Muslims whereas female Muslims can use it.[41]

Islam has strongly forbidden the use of dining crockery/vessels made of gold or silver because it promotes affectation, vanities and pomp and show; moreover, it is the sign of profligacy, lavishness
and extravagance. Thus, it invokes the feelings of materialistic race in the society, man falls prey to pride and pomp; in the pursuit of such accumulation, he employs fowl and fair means and surpasses all the bounds of justice and ethics. Eventually, it leads to ultimate downfall and decay of the society.

**Conclusion:**

All ancient or modern religions of world like Buddhism, Zoroastrianism, Judaism, Christianity, Jainism or Islam emphasize and endeavour for the uplift of highest moral and ethical values to be instilled in human being to procure discipline and good will in global perspective. Some of the religions strictly commands for proper observance and submission to the laws and cannons whereas the other religions do not require strict allegiance so for the code or laws are concerned yet they nourish and treat human emotions and direct them for the general good of the society. Overall, all religions aim at moral and ethical uplift of man, to instill positivity in him and imbue the spirit of sacrifice, equality, affection, brotherhood and justice in mankind.

Thus, these all facts testify that all religions, with some differences of pattern, propagate the message of love, equality, brotherhood, justice and equity in the age of materialistic-accumulation-race and greed-ridden epoch where individual profits and benefit overwhelm collective cause and general welfare of mankind.

**FINDINGS**

The thorough study of religion and human history reveals that religion is an additional blessing and power bestowed upon man that serves as a natural force to direct the cognitive self-will and intellectual power of man to right direction. One cannot deny the fact that the fountainhead of all ethical and moral values of present time is none other but religion.
The history of the world bears testimony that the religious teachings promote peace, love, brotherhood, equality, justice and curb wars, oppression of all sorts, exploitation, selfishness and barbarism.

Whenever, man assumes the entity of a callous barbarian and exercises his natural power and potential to shed blood and commit injustice and oppression, the religion steps forward to enthuse and inspire man with the noblest notion of love, peace, justice, brotherhood and equality. Thus, the course of collective goodness and selfless righteousness get saved from being derailed and man in particular and humanity in general march towards the path of truth, progress and prosperity.

As bodily desires invoke negative feelings like jealousy, anger, selfishness, exploitation; whereas, the religion endeavours to curb these negative feelings and promotes love, tolerance, justice, brotherhood, sympathy, sacrifice, equity and ethical values, hence religious teachings primarily emphasize human rights and service to mankind.

References

2. Dart A. Raymond: The Predatory transition from ape to man 1953 Anthropological and linguistic review. V.I, no. 4, 1953
3. Rasheed Abdul Dr: A Comparative Study of Religions (Urdu) 2000 Tahir Sons Karachi, P: 156
5. AL QURAN 49/13
6. Alavi Khalid Dr: Muhammad the Prophet of Islam 2002 Dawa Academy IIUI Pakistan. P: 279
7. Gurney MD Selwyn Champion and Dorothy Short: Readings from world religions 1994
   Watts and company, London. P: 94


9. AL QURAN 5/32

10. AL QURAN 25/68

11. AL QURAN 6/151

12. Al Bukhari (Note: The Translation of SahihBukhari has been taken by Mohsin Khan:
    Translation of SahihBukhari 1981 Maktaba Al Riaz, 1981 8/48


14. AL QURAN 9/6

15. AL QURAN 4/29

16. AL QURAN 2/188

17. AL QURAN the verses of Holy Quran have been taken from Abdullah Yousuf Ali:
    Translation and commentary of the Holy Quran Beruit Dar Arbia, 5/38)

18. Ibid: 17/33

19. Al Bukhari (Note: The Translation of SahihBukhari has been taken by Mohsin Khan:
    Translation of SahihBukhari 1981 Maktaba Al Riaz, 1/21-22

20. AL QURAN 24/2-3


22. AL QURAN 9/119

23. Al Bukhari 1981 8/75

24. Ibid P: 7

25. AL QURAN 5/90-91

26. Al Bukhari 1981 7/343

27. Ibid 7/341

29. AL QURAN 2/185
30. Ibid 187
32. AL QURAN 7/31
34. Al Bukhari 1981 2/4-5
35. Ibid 7/531
36. Muslim 1955 2/834-835
37. Turmizi 1985 P: 348
38. Ibid P: 348
39. Al Bukhari 1981 7/486
“The Religious Thought and Culture of Kashmir Shaivism in India”

PARDEEP (Research Scholar)  
Special Center for Sanskrit Studies  
Jawaharlal Nehru University  
New Delhi-110067  
INDIA

Abstract: India is birth place of Kashmir Shaivism. It is very rich tradition in Indian knowledge system. This is school of shaivism. According to Kashmir shaivism shreekanthnatha is the founder of this tradition. It is based on Agama’s. The Sanskrit literature classified under two major categories, as known Agama and Nigma. The whole Shaivism is based on Agmas and this had been created by Lord Shiva. There are many philosophical and religious thoughts in Kashmir shaivism. Lord Shiva is famous for worship in India. Lord Shiva is main power of the world according to Kashmir shaivism. The whole world is created by Lord Shiva. There are twelve Joytirlingas of Lord Shiva in India. So the whole India is connected with Shiva through the worship. As well as, Kashmir Shaivism has a great impact on Indian culture. In this tradition lord Shiva’s power is main principal. There are five powers of Lord Shiva: creation, preservation, destruction, concealing and grace. Every time Lord Shiva is connected with Shakti. He can’t work without Shakti. So the Saiva religion contains the most ancient faith of the world. So I want to present, “The Religious Thought and Culture of Kashmir Shaivism in India.”

Key-Words: Agama and Nigma, Indian Culture, Five Powers of Lord Shiva.
**Introduction**: Shruti is the bedrock of Indian Intellectual Tradition tradition. Term Shuri represents the tradition of agam- nigama in Indian knowledge culture. Kullukbhatta a commentator of Manusmruti recognizes the shurti as Veda and Tantra; he gives same importance to them- “Vaidikitantrkichaivadvividhashrutikeertita”।x Nigama and agama these two streams of knowledge enrich Indian cultural tradition.

Word nigama means the veda which is related to external spiritual practices, and the nigama belongs to inner practices. That’s the reason to make rooted with nigama and agama.।x Here Dharma is considered as the main mean of the moksha. This reason makes Indian culture centered with religion and philosophy. Manu’s statement supports this fact- “Vedoakhilo dharmamoolam”।x Religious roots of shaiva philosophy are found in whole vedic literature. Avidance’s of shaivism are also found in digging of hurappan and mohanjoaro civilizations, which proves this philosophy to be earlier than copper-stone age।x This philosophy claims Lord shiva absolute cause of this universe- “ShivaHparamakaranam”।x According to tantrika literature nigama and agama are got from Lord Shiva’s mouth at very first. Later YamalaShastra from agama Vedas came to existence. Creation of Vedas is directed from four Yamalas. It is clearly mentioned in sarvollasatantra also।x Though the inter relation of both becomes clear. This is detailed story of this issue.

**Material and Methods:**
Agama: Agama texts are the basic books of *shaiva* philosophy. *Shiva* is the source agama shastras. Lord *Shiva* blessed sage *Durvasa* with the agamic knowledge and he spread it all over in the world through his tradition of disciples.

Word *agama* suggests *ParaShakti* as an indifferent power of Supreme God (Lord Shiva). It is propounded in *svacchandodyota* - “A samantAtgamayatiaBedenavimRusatipArameSaMsvarUpamitikRutvAparasaktirevAg amaH”. *AcharyaAbhinavagupata* defines *agama* as a mean of exact sense-“dRuDhvimArSarUpaMSabdanamAgamaH A samatAtartahMgamayati”. *Agama* word is known as synonym of *Tantra, siddhanta, vinjnana, and anushthana* etc. in Indian tantric literature. *Tantra* word is formed with the root ‘*tan*’ and suffix ‘*shtran*’ which means the mean to spread. Etymologically it is defined as-“tanyatevistAryej~nAnamanenaititantram”. *Tantra* is the science of gaining or transferring knowledge. *Kamikagama* clarifies *tantra* as- A system which increases the factual knowledge analyzing the factual statements or subjects and protects spiritual practitioners through the same. *Rudrayamalatantra* says here that *tantra* is a system which makes one to know about behavior and spirituality.

Nigma: Similarly nigama word comes here for a system which makes path of knowledge and religion easy. The word nigama is synonym to veda. *Shruti, agama, nigama, trayee, chhandas, ammayasvadhyaya* etc. words are used for veda. Veda word is formed from the root ‘*wid*’ which means to know in addition of suffix ‘*ghanj*’. This suffix stands for subjective and instrumental cause. Thus the word veda generally means the knowledge or sum of knowledge. *AcharyaSayana* defines the Veda as the supreme mean to achieve the things supposed to achieve and avoid others-“iShTaprAptyaniShTpariharyoralaukiakamupAyaMyogranthovedayati,”
Although the *Arhasangrahakara* says- “apauruSheyaMvAkyaMvedaH”. *KashmiraShaivacharyaAbhinavagupta* mentions meaning of Nigama- Nigama or Veda is the system that makes one to know correct information necessary to know the *Dharma*.

AcharyaGopinathaKaviraja says here, “Nigama and Agama both are testimonial form of knowledge. As the word Veda stands for knowledge, similarly Agama also comes for same.”

According to *Svachhandatantra*- “Agamoj~nanamavyaktamanatASAstrakOTayaH” Nigama and Agama have a same stand factually but each of them has a deferent working system. Many things indicate towards their interrelation. Suggestive power (vimrshashakti) of Lord Shiva appears in the form of Agama Tantra. Lord Shiva himself being in guru-shishya-bhava gives the discourse of Agama Tantra in the form questions and answers.

**Kashmir ShaivismCulture and Lord Shiva :** Kashmirshaivism name shows its relation with a specific location. This school of Kashmir-Shaivism is known as *Advaita-Trika* school. This philosophy is also called as *Pratyabhinjna-darshana, Ishvaradvayavada, Spandashastra, Shivadvaya-darshana, Shadardha-darshana.* Spiritualism and spiritual practices are discoursed forcefully in *Advaita-Trika* school. Lord Shiva is the basic element to know this mystique universe according *Advaita-Trika* school. That’s why this philosophy gives much importance to spiritualism and dharma. Spiritual practice, meditation, prayer, and *deeksha* these also have same importance here. Vedic literature is rootsource of all these important elements of religion. Deity *Rudra* praised in many vedicsuktas. Three complete suktas are dedicated to deity *Rudra* in rigveda. Worship of *Shiva-Linga* is clearly mentioned in rigveda. *Rudra* is accepted the creator of universe in Vedas.
Acharya Shankara defines it through a Vedic statement in his Bhshya-“SaktayasyadevasyabrahamaviShNuaSivAtmikAH”. It means that Lord Rudra has three main powers, those are Brahma, Vishnu and Shiva.

The Rudra is the absolute cause and does not need any external force to rule this universe. He appears all bhutas of this universe. Spreading his powers he creates whole existence and absorbs them to destroy it. This thing makes the MaheShvara the greatest of all deities. He is super most of deities and Latent. Rudra’s absolute and universal form is encountered everywhere in Kashmir Shaiva philosophy. Lord Shiva creates the universe by his nature-“svecchayAsvaBittauvaSvamunnIllyati”. Shiva element is also called as anuttaratatva, Parashakti, Parasamvit etc. in Shaiva philosophy. This ParamaShiava is beyond the limits of time, location and cause. Although being a soul Shiva is absolute existence. He is beyond all relations and boundaries.

Five Powers of Lord Shiva: Five acts are naturally pervaded in Shiva. Always he is doing them by his power of liberty like an endless play. These five acts are creation, preservation, destruction, concealing and grace. Creation is Shiva’s joy according to shaiva philosophy. Svachhandatantra gives detailed information on Shiva’s acts. These five acts are mentioned here:

1. Srishti (creation) :- creation is one’s separation from self (creator). This is factual angle. Shiva creates the universe by his nature-“svecchayA svaBittauvaSvamunnIllyati”. Shiva is the cause of creation. Pratyabhinjnakara states here-“citiH svatantratA viSvasiddhihetuH”. Lord Shiva is the cause of all elements Sadashiva to Bhumi (earth).
2. **Sthiti (preservation)**: Lord Shiva situates the world and guard it. Guarding the world Shiva thunders with his powers. That’s why he is called *Bhairava*.\textsuperscript{ix}  
3. **Samhara (Destruction)**: It is absorption in self. The universe spread is absorbed in samhara. Things in the form of result are turned to cause again here in samhara.  
   It is told- “yathā bijōpaganam saMharaH, tathā ShantAnarmagnatApi”.\textsuperscript{ix}  
   Destruction is the samhara from of Shiva.  
4. **Tirodhana (cancellation)**: Here Shiva hides his eternal form. This act is also called *vilaya, vidhana, Tirodhana, nigraha, avarana, and gopan*. And later he reflects in the form of universe. Maya is cover in *Tirodhana*. Soul is covered with Maya.\textsuperscript{ix}  
5. **Anugraha (Grace)**: Here Shiva manifests his eternal form. *Jiva* (the soul) tries to recognize his actual form by the grace of *Guru*. It is also known as *Shaktipata*. This is effect of the highest grace to give *Jivas* salvation-“jIvAnAM mokShasya mUlKAraNAtriKSmArI kRupA”.\textsuperscript{ix}  

Continuity of universe is made by the power of Shiva as mentioned above. Shiva does these acts by his eternal nature with bliss and keeps changing himself into forms. He is everywhere in form of light.

**The 12th Jyotirlinga Shrines of Shiva**: According to *Kotirudrasamhita* of Shiva *purana* Lord Shiva wanders in pilgrims here and there for welfare of Jivas and lives there in Linga form.\textsuperscript{ix} Twelve *Jyotirlingas* are accepted in Indian culture. Men eyeing them once come free from all sins. These are shown in table below.\textsuperscript{ix}  

**Jyotirlingas and their locations:**  


Shiva purana provides detailed information on jyotirlingas. Visiting these is bliss of human-life. These are symbols of Shaivism and cultural unity of India.

**Results :The relevance of Kashmir shaivism :** Effect of Kashmir Shaivism is seen in contemporary Indian society. Also western countries are involved in Shaiva philosophical research. Spiritual ways of this philosophy attracts the mankind. Some of very special values established by philosophy are listed here –

- Kasmir Shaivism shows the path of non-duality.
- This is the philosophy of spiritual thoughts, and a motive for Jiva to follow the spiritual way.
- It helps India to maintain religious and cultural unity.
- It also helps society to keep away the social bars like caste and class etc. each of humans has a right to follow this philosophy and path of spirituality.
- This philosophy protects the tradition of knowledge and culture.

**Conclusion :**The essence of whole wisdom of India is found in Kashmir Shaivism. Its theory of individuality and way of spirituality is the solution of all problems of mankind. But the tradition of Saiva study is being decreased in the scenario of India. A very few scholars are engaged in Shaiva studies like- Prof. NavajivanRastogi and Prof. Mark Dichkausky. These
scholars dedicated their whole life to Shaiva Studies. Finally I pray Lord Shiva with a verse of *yajurveda* for his grace—

“ॐ namaHSaMBavAyacamayoBavAyacanamaHSa~gkarayaca, mayaskarA-yacanamaHSivAyacaSivatarAyaca”.

Reference:


